

UNIVERSITY OF TARTU
Faculty of Social Sciences
Johan Skytte Institute of Political Studies

Ekaterina Tikhonova

REPRESENTATIONS OF THE REFUGEE CRISIS IN THE RUSSIAN MEDIA

MA Thesis

Supervisor: Stefano Braghiroli, PhD

Tartu 2017

I have written this Master's thesis independently. All viewpoints of other authors, literary sources and data from elsewhere used for writing this paper have been referenced.



.....
Ekaterina Tikhonova

The defence will take place on / *date* / at / *time* /
..... / *address* / in auditorium number / *number* /

Opponent / *name* / (..... / *academic degree* /),
..... / *position* /

Representations of the Refugee Crisis in the Russian Media

Ekaterina Tikhonova

Abstract

The current refugee crisis in the European Union already represents the largest movement of people that Europe has seen since the end of the Second World War. It is impossible to ignore the role of journalism in influencing public opinion and the elite's political attitude towards asylees and immigrants. Media can set agendas, frame debates, facilitate decision-making process, and provide real-time information on ethnic relations. The Russian media also takes part in shaping public opinion and raising public awareness towards the refugee crisis in Europe.

The objective of this study is to establish what is being written about the refugee crisis in Russian print media – what are the discourse narratives, including frames, of refugees and the refugee crisis in the Russian media. The central research question is - How do Russian quality newspapers portray refugee crisis in Europe?

Answering the main research question, the method of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) of media text will be applied. Theoretical and methodological frames of this research are predominantly based on Teun A. van Dijk's earlier works on discourse. The analysis is based on the assumption that the closer a newspaper's affiliation appears to governmental structures, the more the narrative reflects the ownership structures; while when the media appears further from the governmental structures the explanatory power of ownership declines, and the relative power of editorial position and specialization increases.

For the purpose of this research four Russian major daily nation-wide quality broadsheet newspapers – *Kommersant*, *Vedomosti*, *Novaya Gazeta*, and *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* – are selected. Newspapers are analysed based on the content of their websites on the topics regarding refugee crisis in Europe, during January 2016 — December 2016, which comprises of 148 articles in total.

Within the discourses of four analysed newspapers, there are seven most common frames of refugees that are highlighted during the analysis: *Refugees as a source of crimes and terrorism*, *Refugees as a threat for the social stability and political security*, *Refugees are not welcomed in Russia*, *Refugees as victims*, *Refugees are not welcomed in Europe*, *Helping refugees*, *Struggling refugees*, *Refugees as illegal immigrants*, *Refugees as abusers of the international law*. Despite multiple similarities, each of the analysed newspapers dealt with the refugee crisis issues differently which reflects in the frequency of publications, utilization of the information sources, and emphasis on different ideas within the narratives.

In light of the outcomes of this thesis, further research can focus on exam of similarities and differences in refugee discourses of different types of Russian media; what kind of visual and linguistic technics and approaches have been utilized in order to create certain framing patterns. Further research may also be directed at the exploration of impact of the media discourse of refugee crisis on the audience.

Table of Contents

Introduction	1
Chapter 1. Development of the Russian Media System	
1.1 General characteristics of Russian media system	5
1.2 Design of the Russian print media system: basis for sample selection	4
1.3 Russia's media in transition: re-establishing state control over media	9
Chapter 2. Portrayal of the Refugee Crisis in the Print Media	
2.1 A broader historical discussion on the portrayal of the refugees	13
2.2 Context of the current immigration and refugee crisis in Europe	15
2.3 Major narratives of the migration and refugee crisis	16
2.4 'Frames' of refugees in European print media	18
2.5 Lack of Russian media studies on refugee crisis	20
Chapter 3. Theoretical and Methodological Frameworks	
3.1 The study of discourse	22
3.2 Media as discourse	25
3.3 Methodology of a CDA of a media text	27
Chapter 4. Methodological Design of the Research	
4.1 Selection of the empirical material for the analysis	31
4.2 Choice of samples	32
4.3 Analytical frame of the discourse analysis of the refugees in Russian print media	35
Chapter 5. Results of Empirical Analysis of Media Discourse	
5.1 Discourse analysis of <i>Kommersant</i>	39
5.2 Discourse analysis of <i>Vedomosti</i>	47
5.3 Discourse analysis of <i>Novaya Gazeta</i>	54
5.4 Discourse analysis of <i>Rossiyskaya Gazeta</i>	62
5.5 Discussion	70
Conclusion	79
Bibliography	82
Annex 1. List of articles	86

Introduction

The current refugee crisis in the European Union already represents the largest movement of people that Europe has seen since the end of the Second World War. It is sometimes described a ‘humanitarian disaster.’ (White; 2015) This challenging experience for Europe creates serious conflicts and debates among member states.

It is impossible to ignore the role of journalism in influencing public opinion and the elite’s political attitude towards asylees and immigrants. Media can set agendas, frame debates, facilitate the decision-making process, and provide real-time information on ethnic relations. As refugees and asylum seekers are considered increasingly newsworthy, they are receiving growing attention from the media. There are a wide variety of approaches on how the press reports on asylum seekers and migrants, including variations of tones and narratives within national media systems. The media representations of asylum seekers are becoming more prominent. A variety of frames and themes have been brought to attention, which underlines the intrinsic complexity of the nature of media discourse. (Berry, Garcia-Blanco, Moore; 2016)

The Russian media also takes part in shaping public opinion and raising public awareness towards the refugee crisis in Europe. However, the attention of media analysts is usually concentrated on Russian mainstream sources, on television, such as *Russia Today* and *RTR* TV channels, or state internal portals, such as *Russian Beyond the Headlines* and *Sputnik*. These sources are far from being credible journalistic sources and could be classified as Russian state instruments of influencing public opinion domestically and abroad. Therefore, it is of great importance to give an overview of a diversity of voices within the current Russian press system. Quality media sources occupy a prominent place in the national media system and deserve particular attention. The narrative discourse on refugee and minorities which they produce on a daily basis seem a relevant issue of a social science research.

Theoretical relevance. There are a number of studies about the press image of refugees and the media portrayal of the refugee crisis in Europe that have been done in recent

years. For instance, *Press coverage of the refugee and migrant crisis of the EU: a content analysis of five European countries (2015)*, produced by the researchers from Cardiff School of Journalism Berry M., Garcia-Blanco I., and Moore K., focuses on the representation of refugees in 1500 articles of Spanish, Italian, Swedish and British newspapers. International review of how media cover migration *Moving Stories (2015)*, published by Ethical Journalism Network of London, which provides an outlook of media portrayal of refugees in 14 countries. The research project *The European migration crisis and the media (2016)*, launched by the London School of Economics and Political Science, looking at the pattern in media coverages of refugees in the press of UK, Denmark, France, Germany, Greece, Hungary, Serbia, Spain, and many others. However, the refugee crisis in the Russian media system remains understudied. Simply few academic studies are available on the issue of the refugee crisis in the Russian media. One significant attempts to bridge this gap is the study *Russian media discourses on Syrian refugees in Europe and Central Asian labour migrants in Russia: Russia for Russians, Europe for...? (2016)* published by the Norwegian Institute of International Affairs. However, this study focuses only on analysis of two media sources: *Russia Today* — a popular media resource for international audience about Russia in English language, and *Argumenty I Fakty* — the daily newspaper for general audience with largest circulation in the country, which can be classified as a ‘tabloid’ and does not necessarily follows quality journalistic standards and codes of ethics. However, the media landscape in Russia is diverse and is represented by hundreds of media outlets on a national level alone. Thus, Russian quality media discourse on refugee crisis remains underrepresented in the academic literature.

The aim and the main research question. The objective of this study is to establish that is being written about refugee groups or the refugee crisis in Russian print media – what are the discourse narratives, including frames, of refugees and refugee crisis in the Russian media and how do they differ from European media stories. The central research question is - *How do Russian quality newspapers portray the refugee crisis in Europe?* The ultimate goal of the analysis is to elaborate on three measurement questions: (i) What constitutes the media discourse and frames of the refugee crises in the Russian print media? (ii) What language does media utilize to describe the problem of the refugee crisis

in the European Union and Russia? (iii) Who is setting the agenda and formulating the discourse?

Research method. In answering the main research question, the method of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) of media text will be applied. Theoretical and methodological frames of this research are predominantly based on Teun A. van Dijk's earlier works on discourse. Thus, the concept of the media discourse is unpacked based on his multidisciplinary approach in Chapter 3 of this thesis. Teun A. van Dijk remains one of the most prominent figures in a critical discourse analysis of the media texts with a particular focus on the analysis of minority, immigrants, refugees and racial issues in the press. The concept of *frames*, central to the media studies, was developed in works of Karten S. Johnson-Cartee. It is also central to the multimodal theory of communication and multimodal analysis elaborated by Gunter K. and van Leeuwen T. For the sake of consistency, frames are conceptualized, according to the discourse analysis approach of Teun A. van Dijk, as a "knowledge units organized around a certain content." (Van Dijk; 1977) Frames have a general nature and specify a typical characteristic. "Although we might also call a frame the set of epistemic units we have about books, balls, and bananas, such units do not as such organize our understanding of the world in a way a conceptual frame as we define it does, viz by also organizing our behaviour with respect to the world, and the ways we interpret others behaviour, as in the frames we have about cashing a check or shopping." (Van Dijk; 1977) The analysis yields an account of the content of discourse, to "how such contents are formulated, that is to style, rhetoric, argumentative or narrative structures or conventional strategies." (Van Dijk; 2015)

The hypothesis for the analysis. The analysis is based on the assumption that the closer a newspaper's affiliation appears to governmental structures, the more the narrative reflects the ownership structures; while when the media appears further from the governmental structures the explanatory power of ownership declines, and the relative power of editorial position and specialization increases.

Selection of samples. For the purpose of this research four Russian major quality broadsheet newspapers are selected. All of these newspapers have daily nation-wide distribution and are well-recognized across the country. Their primary focus is in the areas

of the foreign policy of Russia, the performance of state government, foreign affairs, and broader domestic agendas, concerning the whole country and particular regions. These four newspaper are selected based on several characteristics or selection criteria: (i) Russian national-wide newspapers represented online; (ii) Selected publications should describe the quality media in the country, acknowledge and follow high standards of journalistic principles; represent the journalistic attempts to approaching news agenda. It should be noted, that not every newspaper can be classified as being concerned with journalistic principle; (iii) The primary principle of selection is a differentiation concerning ownership. These four selected newspapers – *Kommersant*, *Vedomosti*, *Novaya Gazeta*, and *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* – are analysed based on the content of their websites on the topics regarding refugee crisis in Europe, during January 2016 — December 2016, which comprises of 148 articles in total. This period has chosen as the most sensitive time of the current refugee crisis when the highest number of people fleeing to Europe was registered.

This thesis consists of an introduction, five chapters, conclusion, bibliography, and annex. The first chapter provides a necessary background to understand the development of the media system in Russia, its problems, and challenges. The second chapter gives an overview of the current refugee crisis and the response of European press to the migration problems. The third chapter provides the theoretical and methodological framework of the research, describing the methodology of discourse analysis of media texts. The fourth chapter discusses the analytical framework of the analysis. The fifth chapter gives results of the empirical analysis of four newspapers. The final discussion section provides a comparative analysis of Russian and European media discourse.

Chapter 1. Development of the Russian Media System

Addressing the objective of this thesis, this first chapter aims to describe key characteristics of the modern Russian media system concerning print media. Some historical and cultural frames are presented, and a brief description of the Russian media model gives the necessary background to understand specific characteristics of Russia's media system. Before going deeper into the analysis of media discourse, we should take into consideration some contemporary features of Russian media system, the relationship between the state government and the media, and the prospects for media freedom in a situation of growing media concentration in the hands of state-affiliated structures.

1.1 General characteristics of Russian media system

The disintegration of the Soviet Union brought a collapse to the old regime of press and broadcasting and introduced the principles of a new media system. The media in Russia has been in transition since 1986 when the rules of private ownership were introduced.

- *A shift from "authoritarianism to the country's newly established democratic pluralism."* (Sheftelevich; 2009) Perestroika and the policy of 'glasnost' created the new circumstances for the development of media in Russia.
- *The importance of professionalism.* Journalists were eager to learn from their colleagues abroad and adopt Western standards and codes of ethics. "Journalists recognize the importance of providing accurate factual information. They show an openness to new, often western ideas and practices and demonstrate a growing recognition of the audience." (De Smaele; 1999)
- *The Principles of press freedom, inadmissibility of censorship and independence of the mass media.* In December 1991 in the Russian Federation Law on Mass Media was signed by President Yeltsin. (Sheftelevich; 2009) The major principles of it established relationships between the state and mass media that were later confirmed by the Russian Constitution of 1993. Among them freedom to "speak, obtain, produce, and disseminate information; to found, own, use, and manage mass media outlets; and to prepare, acquire, and operate technical devices and equipment, raw goods, and materials intended for the production and distribution of mass media products." (Price, Richter, & Peter; 2002) The law describes

appropriate penalties for creating obstacles to the professional activity of journalists and violation of mass media legislation.

The economic growth of the 2000s gave an additional impulse to the development of the press industry. However, the Russian media industry is still young and faces many problems, including limited transparency of the sector, clan principles of managing media enterprises, the close interrelations between media industry and non-media business, the weakness of technical infrastructures, the shortage of high-quality content as well as lack of professionally trained staff, especially in regional media. (Vartanova, Nieminen, & Salminen; 2009)

According to the data provided by *RosokhranKultura* (the federal service supervising the legislation on mass communications), the number of media outlets registered in Russia in the first decade of 2000 was approximately 71 954. However, the actual number of the newspapers and magazines remains unknown. According to the Law on Mass Media, only outlets with 900 copies or more per month are subject to registration. Experts from the National Guild of Publishers and Periodicals believe that non-registered editions could account up to 50 percent of those registered. (Vartanova, Nieminen, & Salminen; 2009)

During the first decade of the 2000s, the Russian print media market showed a great deal of positive change and remained one of the world's leaders concerning growth. "The Russian media industry is gradually changing into a business and developing: sales in advertising are growing, investment in media vehicles is increasing, and modern media technologies are being introduced." (Vartanova, Nieminen, & Salminen; 2009) However, according to the National Centre for Public Opinion (WCIOM), about 21 percent of the population, especially young people, do not read newspapers; readers of weekly national newspapers comprise 18 percent; the audience of entertainment newspapers and magazines is around 25 percent. According to the Russian Periodical Press Market, the structure of the newspaper market in Russia is the following: 33,1 percent – National newspapers, 32,1 percent – local newspapers, 34,8 percent – regional newspapers. (Vartanova, Nieminen, & Salminen; 2009)

1.2 Design of the Russian print media system: basis for sample selection

Russian scholars of media and mass communication, such as Mikhail Shkondin, Iosif Dzjaloshinskiy, and Aleksandr Akopov describe the structure of print media system in Russia, known as *Typology of mass media*. This classification of print media is used for selection of newspapers for this analysis. This typology divides newspapers into groups based on a set of attributes.

- Geography of distribution

National media: print and online media outlets, which are known across the country and mainly focus on the foreign policy of Russia, the performance of state government, and broader domestic agendas, which concern the whole country. Online media outlets of this kind are also available to Russian speakers abroad (for example, *Vedomosti*, *Kommersant*, *Izvestia*);

Regional media: publications with local distribution, including subjects of the federal system – kray, republic, oblast, or bigger entities – Ural, Western Siberia, Far East (for example, *Kommersant. Siberia*);

Local media: the largest and most structurally diverse category of media outlets in Russia. Media outlets of this group differ from one region to another, encompassing the specifics of a particular area and not interconnected (for example, *Tomskaya Nedelya*);

Community papers: publications, which are distributed within a community.

- Quality of content (needs of audience)

Quality media: analytical media that follows high professional standards (for example, *RBK daily* and *Kommersant*)

Tabloid media: outlets for mass audience with entertaining content, usually based on gossips or unverified content (for example, *Argumenti I Fakty*)

Mixed type: quality media with portion of entertainment content (for example, *Izvestiya*)

- Specialized media. Media outlets for a particular kind of audience, such as national minority groups, religious groups, professional groups, or gender specialized (*GQ*, *Vogue* magazines).

- Types of ownership. Media in Russia can be owned privately, by businesses, corporations, or the state. On the national level, the state newspapers are presented

by *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*, *Parlamentskaya Gazeta*, magazines *Rodina*, and *Rossiyskaya Federaciya Segodnya*. However, in the regional media market state editions are few: most of the newspapers and magazines are either private or with limited state participation. (Vartanova, Nieminen, & Salminen; 2009)

In comparison to the Soviet period, where regional or local newspapers lagged behind, because readers preferred nation-wide newspapers, the transition of market economy reinforced the advantages of local press with cheaper delivery. The late 1990s – beginning of 2000s many local newspapers managed to archive a broader reach. The audience gave its preference to local media as those having a close connection with its readers and reflection on problems of a particular region. (Vartanova, Nieminen, & Salminen; 2009)

One of the important changes of the new Russian media system was the development of quality media targeting business circles. One of examples of this new-born quality media was weekly newspaper *Kommersant*, first appeared in December 1989. “It was bold and ironic publication. Every headline was carefully cultivated and bred to maximum effect.” (Zasurskii; 2004) The newspaper positioned itself as quality press. Its circulation grew from forty thousand to half a million in one year. It shortly expanded to a daily newspaper with a weekly magazine, which lately was reorganized into two publications: *Vlast magazine* on politics and social agenda, and *Dengi magazine* dedicated to economics. *Kommersant* established well-known newspaper journalism school in Russia. (Zasurskii; 1999)

To sum up, the system of print media in Russia is very diverse. It is still relatively young and has elements inherited from the Soviet system, as well as principles of a market economy. At the beginning of the 2000s it showed lots of development, however, currently, the system is experiencing a stagnation tied with the economic crisis in the country and conservative political orientations.

1.3 Russia's media in transition: re-establishing state control over media

The transitional period of media development from an instrument of Soviet propaganda to modern Russian media system pre-defines certain features and challenges that should be taken into consideration while analysing print media discourse in Russia.

Yassen Zassoursky, the president of the Journalism Department of the Lomonosov State University in Moscow, in his article *Media and the public interest* identifies one of the biggest challenges of the Russian media – balancing between the state, business and the public sphere. “Free press is crucial for a democratic society: it unfolds the public sphere, contributes to the public debate, it is supposed to develop informed and participating citizens and open the way for public opinion to play a central role in the running of the nation-state.” (Zassoursky; 2001)

- *Economic problems.* From the beginning of perestroika until now, the development of the media has been determined by economic circumstances and trends of the media business in the country. The media were the first to feel the ‘turbulent economy’ of yearly 1990s. In 1992, prices for newsprint and distribution increased drastically. It affected the prices of newspapers and, eventually, led to cuts in press circulation. (Zassoursky; 1996) Even though mass media obtained freedom fixed in legislation, media business itself were not profitable. By 1995, newspapers gained from 30 to 50 percent of their budgets from advertising, however, it was not enough to run publications. (Rantanen; 2002) Print media started to look for ways to earn money. For example, business daily *Kommersant* published its weekly paper in English and distributed it in the United States and Europe for Russian communities abroad. *Nezavisimaya Gazeta* runs an advertising agency, which offered Russian companies an opportunity for advertising its business in *The Washington Times*. A broadsheet *Izvestia* together with German publisher co-ran advertising agency *Burda*. Jointly with *the Financial Times* of London, *Izvestia* launched weekly financial newspaper *Finansovye Izvestia*. However, there was no universal remedy for survival at that time. The majority of local media has no business opportunity to chase. The only ways to survive was to take governmental subsidies. (Richter; 1995)
- *State grants for media.* Starting from 1991, the Ministry of Press and Information

starting distributing subsidies, mainly to support media for children, disabled people, national minorities, literary and cultural magazines. Subsidies were also allocated to the press that covers so-called common information space of the former Soviet Union. Just a few publications, among which *Moskovskie Novosti*, *Kommersant*, and *Kuranty* rejected any form of state support. (Price, Richter & Peter; 2002) According to Iosif Dzyaloshinskiy, in 1996 around 85 percent of all registered papers declared that they received some support either from state or sponsors (Dzyaloshinskiy; 2001). Only 4 percent of national papers claimed that they were profitable. (Hagstrom; 2000)

- *Involvement of 'politicized capital' in the media business.* Another power that influenced media market at that time was the new-born financial elite or oligarchs. Yassen Zassoursky called this phenomenon 'politicized capital.' After almost a decade of transition from an administrative-bureaucratic model to the democratized market, the media was facing new challenges as "the government and private corporations attempt to use the media as instruments, tools, and sources of power." (Zassoursky; 1996) For example, Boris Berezovsky's media empire included *Ogoniok* weekly magazine, *ORT TV*, and *Nezavisimaya Gazeta*. Vladimir Gusinskiy, the former head of the Most Bank, created the largest media empire, including *Gazeta Segodnya* newspaper, *Itogi magazine* (published in cooperation with Newsweek), the *NTV* television channel, and *Echo Moskvy* radio station. With media ownership, oligarchs achieved political power. For instance, both oligarchs supported Boris Yeltsin during his political campaign in 1996. Although, Russian media became more diverse concerning ownership types, nonetheless, media was not politically neutral. (De Smaele; 1999)

'Two-tier' media system. The contemporary Russian media system is best described as consisting of 'two tiers.' (Dunn; 2014) This is an important characteristic that began to emerge in the 1990s that we should take into consideration while describing the contemporary Russian media model.

- *The first tier represents media outlets with political control or affiliation.* These outlets mainly serve Kremlin's point of view and are in favor of the state's position. Different categories of the media belong to this group: Information Agencies (*Rossiia Segodnya*), nearly all national-wide TV channels (*ORT*, *NTV*,

Rossiya24), newspapers with national distribution networks (*Izvestiya*, *Komsomolskaya Pravda*, *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*), and radio stations (*Russkaya Sluzhba Novostei*). (Dunn; 2014)

- *The second tier is made up of free media, or outlets with a considerable degree of freedom.* Media of this type are involved in the open discussion of topics with high sensitivity, such as ethnic conflicts, corruption, aspects of domestic and foreign policy. Journalists follow high professional standards and represent different opinions, and produce independent investigations. This is a quite diverse group of media outlets represented by TV Channels (*Dozhd*, *CurrentTimeTV*, *REN-TV Channel*), nation-wide newspapers (*RBK Daily*, *Kommersant*, *Novaya Gazeta*, *Vedomosti*), information agencies (*Interfax*, *Itartas*), radio stations (*Ekho Moskvy*, *Serebryanniy Dozhd*), as well as the majority of online media outlets (*Mediza*, *TaigaInfo*, *Takie Dela*). (Dunn; 2014)

The distribution and popularity of different types of media are not even across the country. In 2010, a survey by the Levada Center showed the high importance of television: nearly 90 percent of the population used television as their prime source of information about Russian domestic and foreign policy. Even though the survey reported that 28-30 percent of the population regularly used the internet, only 9 percent regarded it as a prime source of news. Therefore, TV channels with nationwide coverage play the most influential role and are by far tightly controlled. (Dunn; 2014)

The existence of the two-tier structure raises the question on why certain outlets were able to maintain and preserve some degree of independence and did not allow the Kremlin to exercise total control over the media system. In answering this question, the first argument that can be made is the ‘safety-valve’ effect. This type of media provides the space for independent journalists who are not welcomed in the state-controlled media. They do not have a significant influence on the audience and become dissidents. Therefore, they are kept in the system, but cannot reach the broad audience. The same principle applies to their consumers – a small, highly-educated, intellectually talented community. The second factor is that media of different types is needed to “ensure the efficient functioning of a complex modern society”: “Post-Soviet Russia is a much more complex society, which for all its proclaimed distinctiveness is much more closely integrated with the

outside world. In these circumstances, it is easy to appreciate the need that academic, business and government circles have for information that is both accurate and complete.” (Dunn; 2014) The third factor is the international representation. Politically Russia positions itself as guided and sovereign democracy. Some scholars argue that a small segment of free and independent media is needed for the country to be able to participate in international organizations, such as the OSCE. It would be tough to demonstrate this commitment without the possibility to point out to part of the media as being free. (Dunn; 2014)

Even though media obtained freedom based on legislation, major media outlets remained to gain considerable state financial support. There are still media outlets, on the local and federal level, with a great degree of freedom. However, they experience constant pressure and cannot manage to reach a broad audience, the media is remaining for elite groups. Since the 2000s, Putin’s state-centric political regime emerged. With the process of nation-building and formation of shared values that could go beyond ethnic and regional lines, the state began to use media as a tool to maintain and support the vertical power system, create a unified national identity, and downplay any political debates. (Vartanova; 2012)

Chapter 2. Portrayal of the Refugee Crisis in the Print Media

When studying Russian media discourse on immigrants and refugees, we should keep in mind the overarching European media context. The Russian media system has a lot in common with European media structures: similar discourse narratives can be found in both European and Russian print media, they follow the same journalistic principles, and Russian media often refers to European media discourse as a source of ideas and information, as it was proven in the fifth chapter of this Thesis. This second chapter provides analysis of the media discourse on the refugee crisis in various European media outlets and the debate regarding the media's response to the crisis in different countries. This will help us to put the analysis of Russian media in a broader European context. At first, it describes a historical context of the European media studies on minorities and refugees. Then, it provides the analysis of the media discourse on the current refugee crisis in Europe. And, finally, it places an emphasis on the lack of Russian media analysis of the migrants and refugees.

2.1 A broader historical discussion on the portrayal of the refugees

European media has a longstanding tradition covering immigrants and refugees. This short historical overview gives us an idea of how media discourse has developed over time and why the media plays a significant role in constructing ideas, stereotypes, and prejudices about immigrants. Extensive studies of immigrants and refugees in the media have started in the 1960s. Multiple studies of Dutch press in 1980 shows a particular importance of social and economic problems concerning immigration. Migrants, in general, were associated with crime, deviance as well as "threat, tension, conflict, problems, and other difficulties." (Van Dijk; 1987) Most of the press coverages of minorities are about crime, human arrests, illegal immigration and the debate about legislation.

Teun A. Van Dijk argues that media plays an important role and contributes significantly to the reproduction of "stereotypes, prejudices and eventually racism." (Barker; 1981) It can be effective to marginalize and exclude minorities and establish the ethnic hegemony of majority.

The media narratives are subject to change. Stergios Fotopoulos and Margarita Kaimaklioti provide an example of an attitude shift within the British media. During the Balkan conflict of 1999, the newspapers in the UK adopted predominantly positive descriptive practices towards covering migration issues. In contrast, in 2008 mainly negative representation of migrants and ‘hostility themes’ within the British press were documented. (Fotopoulos & Kaimaklioti; 2016)

Vanessa Christoph highlights the fact that even though media plays a significant role in integration migrants within the society, the media usually portrays migrants in a negative manner. “The mass media usually referring to them as members of an ethnic group rather than as individuals, leading to the creation of a negative image of the entire group in the society.” (Christoph; 2012) Media have the power to create ‘pictures in our heads’ — stereotypes that help us comprehend the complexity of the world around. (Lippman; 1922) For example, D. Muller published an overview of German newspapers covering foreigners in the period of 1960-1999 and concluded that the media provided a few reports about aliens; most of them were negative. (Bleich, Bloemraad & de Graauw; 2015)

As refugees and asylum seekers are considered increasingly newsworthy, they are receiving growing attention from the media. “Media set agendas and frame debates. They provide the information which citizens use to make sense of the world and their place within it.” (Berry, Garcia-Blanco & Moore; 2016) Joseph Trap in his book *Media in Europe Today* assumes that there is a connection between the way in which the media deals with ethnic minorities as such and the degree of negativity in the host society. In 2003, there was a national survey in 15 ‘old’ EU member states of the national and daily press, which revealed that minorities tend to be underrepresented, and more often they are presented in a negative context. Their appearance in the spheres of society are linked to crimes and deviancies. (Trappel, 2011)

The media narratives are highly interlinked with public perception and political debates. The press is a major source of data to be used for the construction the image of refugees because it has power over “the selection, extent, frequency, and nature of their reporting.” (Joris, d’Haenens, Van Gorp & Mertens; 2016) Media naturally uses its power to influence the interpretation of the reality and emphasize individual frames. At the same

time, media has authority to make some aspects of problem more visible, while neglect or diminish the other. (Joris, d'Haenens, Van Gorp & Mertens; 2016)

2.2 Context of the current immigration and refugee crisis in Europe

When it comes to the current refugee crisis, European media were the first to have a response, due to the crisis particularly affecting many European countries. For the sake of consistency, by 'European media' we mean only newspapers, of different types, published on the territory of European countries. We should refer to the European press narratives on immigrants and refugees to put Russian media discussion in the context. While analyzing Russia's media discourse on refugee crisis, it is very relevant to take into account experiences of European newspapers, to compare or oppose them, or to see what elements of the European media discourse were borrowed.

- *Current refugee crisis started in 2015*, when, according to Eurostat, EU member states received over 1.2 million asylum applications, twice as many as the previous year. People who applied for asylum status are mainly those who escape from war and persecution in their home countries. The top three countries were Syria (29 percent), Afghanistan (14 percent) and Iraq (10 percent). (Joris, d'Haenens, Van Gorp & Mertens; 2016)
- *Forced migration rapidly became a topic of a political debate across Europe*. Right after first reports about the deaths of migrants trying to reach Europe appeared in the news, it became a profoundly political issue. The narratives and the picture of refugees that media translates play a critical role in maintaining the attitude towards the refugee crisis as such. (Szczepanik; 2016)
- *European media were the first to respond to the refugee crisis*. They struggle to balance between political agenda and real human stories. However, being in the middle of the crisis, they provide a necessary platform for political and social debate, therefore play a significant role in finding the solution to the crisis.
- *From the beginning, European media were struggling to agree upon terminology usage*. A debate emerged in whether the EU faced a 'refugee' crisis or the 'migrant crisis.' In 2015 *Al Jazeera* reported: "There is no 'migrant' crisis in the Mediterranean. There is a very large number of refugees fleeing unimaginable misery and." (White; 2015) Analyzing the discussion, Tony Bunyan points out that usually the term 'migrant' is used in the media regarding the 'economic

migrants,’ meaning those who is simply seeking a better life and economic benefits from moving to another country. In the meantime, the terms ‘refugee’ or ‘asylum-seeker’ have different meaning and cannot be used interchangeably. In the media and political discourses, we quite often can meet the phrasing ‘illegal migrant’ which involves a negative connotation. However, there is no such a thing as ‘illegal migrant’ – the more accurate and neutral term is undocumented.’ (White; 2015)

- *Dehumanization of migrants and refugees.* Marta Szczepanik concludes that the most important aspect of the social perception of refugees in European media is ‘dehumanization.’ They are presented as a speechless and anonymous ‘sea of humanity,’ which provides a justification for keeping refugees out of Europe. (Szczepanik; 2016)

2.3 Major narratives of the migration and refugee crisis

Marta Szczepanik argues that very soon narratives with the attributes of ‘good’ or ‘genuine’ and ‘bad’ refugees became a popular trend in print media discourse in Europe. The characteristics of ‘good’ refugee – “female, poor, helpless and possessing a particular nationality” are usually taken for granted. (Szczepanik; 2016) For example, different ways of presenting passive and suppressed women or children and powerful men in the photographs, or casual references to a number of innocent women and children who died. There are several other attributes of ‘genuine’ refugees, based on the comments on social media: (a) material situation of individual (possession of goods like smartphone or personal computer); (b) the marriage status of traveller (men traveling alone were usually accused of leaving their women and children behind); (c) nationality (for example, Pakistani asylums are seen as having no circumstance while Syrian origin was accepted as legitimizing the protection claim). At the same time, individuals attributed as a ‘bad’ refugees are seen as those who abuse social welfare. Some articles on the media suggest that arriving asylum seekers are mostly men who would rather ‘benefit from social assistance then become economically independent.’ However, she argues, UNHCR has already noticed that men and women migrate at different times: usually, men migrate first and then helps to move his family. Fairly often this context is omitted in the media publications. (Szczepanik; 2016)

Stergios Fotopoulos and Margarita Kaimaklioti are looking into how the refugee crisis has been addressed in Greek, German, and British press. Their analysis suggests that refugees predominantly were portrayed as victims of the civil war in Syria, helpless and desperate with a particular focus on the numbers of people. The EU-Turkey agreement was the top of the daily coverage: various articles expressed scepticism and concerns regarding its legality. As a common trend, newspapers paid great attention to the issues of child refugees who are facing “inhumane living conditions and various atrocious threats.” (Fotopoulos & Kaimaklioti; 2016)

Mike Berry, Inaki Garcia-Blanco, Kerry Moore in their report, addressed to the United Nation High Commission for Refugees in December 2015, stressed the idea that European media are far from giving a united response to the crisis. “While some outlets joined the call for more assistance, others were unsympathetic, arguing against increasing rescue operation.” (Berry, Garcia-Blanco & Moore; 2016) After the analysis of thousands of articles, published during the period of 2014-2015 in five European Union states (UK, Germany, Spain, Italy and Sweden), researchers concluded that there are major differences between member states in terms of the sources of information journalists use, the language they employ, and the solutions they suggest. The main findings are:

- German and Swedish media predominantly used the terms ‘refugee’ or ‘asylum seeker,’ Spanish press - ‘immigrant,’ Italian and the UK press - ‘migrant.’ These terms have slightly different meanings which might affect the understanding of the public.
- The Swedish press provided the most positive coverage of refugees and migrants, while coverage in the United Kingdom was the most cynical and polarized.
- Absent of homogeneity within national media system. The most similar press response was in Spanish, Italian and Swedish media, meaning that newspapers within a country tend to report on the same themes.
- The EU response to the crisis was seen as inadequate. Journalists expressed the idea that the migration crisis should be solved collectively “at the EU level, rather than by individual member states.” (Berry, Garcia-Blanco & Moore; 2016) Journalists, multiple times, highlighted the proposals of a different approach to the crisis made by EU’s authorities. Therefore, the EU’s institutions were often

presented as “slow, bureaucratic and divided.” (Berry, Garcia-Blanco & Moore; 2016)

- There were different explanations of causes and solutions to the crisis. Some newspapers viewed migration flows as “driven by wars, human rights abuses, and repressive regimes.” (Berry, Garcia-Blanco & Moore; 2016) Italian, Spanish and British newspapers – focused on the humanitarian catastrophe in Libya and the role of people smugglers. There were just a few reports focused on the potential benefits that asylum seekers could bring to the host country in the Swedish and German press. (Berry, Garcia-Blanco & Moore; 2016)

Moving stories: International review of how media cover migration, published in London by Ethical Journalism Network in 2015 presents an analysis of refugee coverage in 15 countries. Authors claim that in most of the countries the story line has been dominated by two themes – numbers and emotions. They also drew attention to the fact that the situation with the media in different parts of the world was particularly similar: “journalism under pressure from a weakening media economy; political bias and opportunism that drives the news agenda; the dangers of hate-speech, stereotyping and social exclusion of refugees and migrants.” (White; 2015) Authors argue that media failed to alert the audience about the upcoming crisis. This shows the weakness of media and underestimation of many problems journalists face in front of the social responsibility to cover this humanitarian crisis professionally. (White; 2015)

2.4 ‘Frames’ of refugees in European print media

One of the principle academic sources for this Thesis is the study *The refugee crisis in Europe: a frame analysis of European newspapers*. For the sake of the analysis leading quality daily newspapers in five European countries - *Der Standard* (Austria), *Suddeutsche Zeitung* (Germany), *De Standaard* (Belgium), *Le Monde* (France), and *The Daily Telegraph* (United Kingdom) – were selected. Authors use the framing theory, assuming that “media may use their power of influence by interpreting the reality and emphasizing on particular news perspectives or frames while silencing others,” (Joris, d’Haenens, Van Gorp & Mertens; 2016) and highlight leading ‘frames’ of media discourse. These ‘frames,’ complemented by the report *Press coverage of the refugee and*

migrant crisis in the EU: a content analysis of five European countries prepared for the UN High Commissioner for Refugees, will be further used for the analysis of Russian quality media discourse on refugee crisis.

- *Asylum seeker as a victim.* Asylum seekers are portrayed as victims with the focus on their personal stories, problems that they face in their home countries, and life-threatening journey to Europe. Woman and children, as recipients of the problem, are often in the focus of these publications. This frame brought emotional aspects to the story and appeared in the majority of newspapers.
- *Illegal migrant and deportation.* This frame was predominantly used to cover issues of economic migration but was the least popular. From 6 percent (in the UK) to 13 percent (in Germany) of the publications were dedicated to the issues of illegal migration. Topics on this matter were always followed by the debate on a clear distinction between political refugees and economic migrants which can be rather troublesome.
- *A positive effect of migration.* This frame was one of the least used among newspapers under study. However, some publications brought pro-immigration perspective, arguing that immigrating may bring economic gain to the host countries, enrich Europe's labour market and cultural diversity.
- *Increased insecurity.* This frame was common for all countries. Publications were focusing on uncertainty directly caused by migrants and right-wing rhetoric which directly triggered by the refugee crisis.
- *The leading role of the West to solve refugee crisis.* This frame emphasis responsibility of European countries and promoted pro-immigration sentiment. On the one hand, it was used to support pro-migration ideas in a country. On the other hand, this frame was used to blame other European countries that do not accept as many refugees.
- *'Unwanted' invaders or criminals.* In some media, refugees were positioned as 'unwanted,' as someone to be fearful of. In the UK and Australian press, the metaphor of criminal was quite common, meaning that refugees might be potentially dangerous for the country's security. Therefore, they need to be "isolated from the rest." (Parker; 2015)

- ‘*Boatpeople*.’ This word refers to those who are attempting to enter the country illegally by boat. By using this term, media created the line between ‘undeserving’ and ‘deserving’ asylum seekers, as well as ‘them’ from ‘us.’ (Parker; 2015)

2.5 Lack of Russian media studies on refugee crisis

Russia plays a role in the current refugee crisis. First, it takes part in a military operation in Syria which provokes refugee fleeing to Europe. Second, it is an outstanding humanitarian player in the region. Third, it accepts Syrian refugees, even though the number is relatively small. According to the Federal Migration Service of Russia, there are currently 7 424 Syrians in the country. (Malinkin; 2015)

Russian media has gained a wealth of experience of covering migrants’ and minority issues, starting from the early 1990s. However, it relates mostly to labour migrants from Central Asian countries and other – former Soviet Union republics. For example, Elena Bazina in her article *Themes of migration and migrants in the Russian press* (Bazina; 2015) examines the central tendencies in covering immigration during the period from 1991 to 2013. She argues that the Russian media assess the migration process as neutral, while the image of migrants as ‘others’ are portrayed negatively. The study also shows the variation and changes of media discourses concerning period of migration, type of migrants, region of origin and type of the press.

However, the refugee’s portrayal in the Russian media remains understudied, regarding both national and local media. One of the examples - the study on the image of the European refugee crisis, based on the analysis of two media outlets - TV channel *Russia Today* and largest weekly publication *Argument I Factly*. This study is one of the few within this field that shows the narrative change on the refugee crisis. Before Russia’s involvement in the Syrian conflict, refugees were portrayed as “tragic victims of external involvement” (Gabdulhakov; 2016), linking the refugee flows to consequences of failed policies of the US and NATO. However, after Russia’s military involvement, the media changed its narratives, and the tone shifted from sympathetic to critical. The study shows that some Russian media has a tendency to portray refugees in Europe as a security threat. The author argues that the effect of Russian media coverage, particularly *Russia Today*,

were especially visible in Germany, where minority groups inspired by the media-organized protests against refugees.

Nonetheless, considering the volume of the media market in Russia, discussed previously, and its differences, based on the audience, region, specialization and the area of distribution, the issues of the refugee crisis as well as its portrayal remains to be underrepresented. Therefore, it is important to elaborate more on how different types of Russian media reflect on the migration and refugee crisis in Europe, which is the purpose of this thesis.

Chapter 3. Theoretical and Methodological Frameworks

The third chapter aims at describing the theoretical framework of the thesis. At first, it is focusing at outlining a study of discourse as a multi-disciplinary approach to social science. A discourse analysis of media texts (newspapers, in particular) has its specific characteristics and features that should be taken into consideration to design a methodological frame for a study of specific media cases. Second, this chapter gives necessary background of the development of discourse studies and shows the differences between discursive approaches amidst scholars. Theoretical and methodological frames of this Thesis are predominantly based on Teun A. van Dijk's prior works on discourse. He remains one of the most prominent figures in a critical discourse analysis of media texts with a particular focus on the analysis of minority, immigrants, refugees and racial issues in the press. Finally, this chapter describes a broad methodological concept of critical discourse analysis, based on van Dijk's understanding of discourse, which will be further used for developing a methodological frame to serve the purpose of the analysis of the refugee crisis in the Russian quality print media.

3.1 The study of discourse

One of the most influential contributions to the development of the theory of discourse analysis were made by Norman Fairclough and Teun A. van Dijk. The contemporary theory of communication does not put much emphasis on communication as a process, but rather communication as a generation of meanings. (Fiske; 2010) One powerful way of thinking about media content is originated in the general study of language. Since the 1970s the study of media discourse emphasizes the understanding of communication as a social action. (Jensen; 2013)

Defining 'discourse' is rather difficult. In a broader context, it is "the study of linguistic relations and structures in discourse." (Cameron & Panovic; 2014) Discourse has three primary dimensions: (i) discourse is a language "above the sentence", meaning that traditional linguistics tends to focus on a sentence level analysis; (ii) discourse is "language in use"; (iii) discourse is a form of social practice in which language plays a central role. (Cameron & Panovic; 2014)

The term 'discourse' usually refers to a form of language use, public speeches and, generally, to spoken language. Social actors use language to communicate ideas or beliefs. Therefore, discourse incorporates three main dimensions: (i) language use; (ii) the communication of beliefs, and (iii) interaction in a social situation. (Van Dijk; 1997) Discourse should be studied not only as a form, meaning and mental process. However, also "as complex structures and hierarchies of interaction and social practice and their functions in context, society, and culture." (Van Dijk; 1997) Discourse as a form of action and interaction has social roots. However, the theoretical linkage between discourse and society is very complex and can be explained on several levels.

(i) Context: discourse analysis studies discourse in context. It includes the role and purpose of participants, time and place of interaction, and so forth. Discourse is studied as "being accomplished in the social situation," (Van Dijk; 1997) where properties of participants, such as gender, age, relation to the authorities, their action roles, play a significant role in formulating and influencing the discourse.

(ii) Action: discourse is a form of action as it is mostly intentional and purposeful human activity, such as social conversations, dialogues, debates and other forms of social interactions. Such actions are imbibed in social life and define discursive practices. (Van Dijk; 1997)

(iii) Power: it is a fundamental notion while studying the relationships between discourse and society. The focus is narrowed to the social power, which defines "a specific relation between social groups or institutions." (Van Dijk; 1997) (a) Persuasive power: control over minds. Instead of ordering someone to do something, we persuade them. There are different forms of persuasion, such as arguments, suggestions, explicit threats. (b) Hegemonic power: discourse can make people believe and act as the powerful group wants "out of their own free will." (Van Dijk; 1997) Texts and talks can manipulate people and make them act as the powerful group desires. It may be done through education, propaganda, the media and other public discourse. Traditional power, including force, money, and politics, have become less relevant in contemporary discourse, the importance of the symbolic power, such as control over resources, expertise, information, the media arise. (Van Dijk; 1997)

(iv) Ideology: this is a cognitive counterpart of power that helps to establish links between discourse and society on a different level. “Ideology, as a means of reproducing domination, serves to coordinate social practices of dominant group members so as to perpetuate their dominant position as a group.” (Van Dijk; 1997) Thus, it makes sure that the members of the society will act similarly on similar occasions. Ideologies are, by nature, social (not individual), and they need to be shared. Ideology features the knowledge of the group: “what knowledge for one group may be seen as an ideology by others.” (Van Dijk; 1997) Ideology maintains a close connection to the discourse in the form of domain group beliefs which influence members of a group. (Van Dijk; 1997)

Critical discourse analysis (CDA) emerged as an interdisciplinary field of study between the mid-1960s and mid-1970s. As an interdisciplinary approach, it borrows substantially from discourse linguistics, psychology, conversational analysis, ethnography of speaking, sociolinguistics, and micro-sociology. CDA has its academic origins in Western Marxism that emphasizes the “role of cultural dimensions in reproducing capitalist’s social relations,” (Fairclough & Wodak; 2011) including key figures – Antonio Gramsci, the Frankfurt school, and Louis Althusser. Other influential figures developing the study of discourse were French philosopher Michel Foucault and sociologist Pierre Bourdieu. While Foucault understands discourses as knowledge systems of the human sciences to inform social and governmental technologies that constitute power in the society, Pierre Bourdieu was focused on “relationship between language, social position and symbolic value in the dynamic of power relations.” (Fairclough & Wodak; 2011) The figure of Russia philosopher Mikhail Bakhtin was also important with this regard. He developed a theory of genre and emphasized the “dialogical properties of texts, introducing the idea of intertextuality,” according to which any text has a link to a chain of texts “reacting to, and transforming other texts.” (Fairclough & Wodak; 2011) The foundations of CDA were also laid by the critical linguistics, developed in Great Britain in the 1970s. It drew its attention to “ideological potency of certain grammatical forms like passive structures and nominalizations.” (Fairclough & Wodak; 2011) Structuralism and semiotics, in particular, became an important basis for discourse studies. Development of structural linguistics pushed forward by Claude Levi-Strauss and inspired by Russian formalists, Vladimir Propp in particular, stimulated a growing movement known as French structuralism. Representatives of this school showed a particular interest in the analysis

of narrative. This growing movement with diverse sets of approaches gave birth to another discipline – semiotics. It allowed anthropologists, literary scholars, linguists, sociologist to study social practices that allow cross-disciplinary comparison and coherence. (Van Dijk; 2013)

Norman Fairclough's approach to the discourse study has explored the "discursive aspect of a contemporary process of social transformation," (Fairclough & Wodak; 2011) including the concepts of 'neoliberalism,' 'globalization,' 'knowledge-based economy.' Later contributions by Ruth Wodak and other scholars in Vienna, based on the tradition of Bernsteinian sociolinguistics and the Frankfurt School, were focusing on interdisciplinary studies of sexism, antisemitism, and racism with the aim of the practical application of the discourse-historical approach.

In modern understanding of discourse analysis, discourse is primarily taken as a specific form of social interaction. (Van Dijk; 1987) Social actors participate in discourse as they are involved in any other kind of social interaction. Language is not seen as a channel that communicates a pre-existing reality. But rather subjective realities is constituted through discourse and defined through language use in everyday texts and talks. (Wetherell & Potter; 1992)

3.2 Media as discourse

Media plays an intermediary role when it comes to reproducing a public discourse. Most of the social and political knowledge about the world comes from news reports we read or see every day. Structures of media discourse have social, political, or ideological implications. Media actively incorporate other discourses, produced by institutions, government, politicians, union groups, and so on, into its agenda. Therefore, much of the news are not about events that happened in the past, but rather what other actors, usual representatives of power and elite, have to say about it. (Van Dijk; 1987)

One of the central scholars, when it comes to studying media discourse on the minorities and refugees, is Dutch Professor Teun A. van Dijk. He argues that discourse analysis approach is especially useful when it comes to studying the representation of minorities in the media, such as refugees or ethnic minorities. He claims that ethnic prejudice is

socially reproduced through discourse, therefore, to understand social communication of ethnic attitudes, we should examine the structure of discourses in details. One of the major channels reproducing them is print media. (Van Dijk; 1987)

Most of van Dijk earlier work focuses on the reproduction of racism and ethnic tensions in discourse. He started with a critical discourse analysis of the news of migrants and refugees. Thus he examines the role of the news media in the reproduction of racism and ethnic stereotypes. After applying qualitative and quantitative analytical approaches to thousands of the news pieces of the British and Dutch press, van Dijk discovered the most common topics regarding ethnic minorities in the press. Among the most popular topics: new illegal immigrants are arriving; political response on new immigration; social problems regarding employment and welfare; cultural characteristics: how are they different; focus on threats: violence, crime, drugs, prostitution; integration conflicts. Each of these, even potentially neutral, topics tend to have negative dimensions. In his latest studies, he argues that elite plays a crucial role in the reproduction of racism. (Fairclough & Wodak; 2011)

Media discourse is the main source of people's knowledge, attitudes, and ideologies both for elites and ordinary citizens. Of course, the media do it together with elites, politicians, professionals and academics. The media elites are ultimately responsible for the prevailing discourses of the media they control. Teun A. van Dijk calls media the most influential form of public discourse: "The media are able to abuse such power and establish the discursive and cognitive hegemony." (Van Dijk; 2000) In general, minorities have less access to the media due to the lack of source of discourses such as press conferences, press releases, briefings, interviews and so on. The systematic negative portrayal of the Others contributes to negative mental models, stereotypes, and prejudices, hence directly to the reproduction of discrimination. (Van Dijk; 2000)

3.3 Methodology of a CDA of a media text

General overview

Discourse analysis presupposes that media messages are specific types of texts. This attention to the media is justified by realizing how important the media is to our everyday lives. Media studies show a particular interest in the sets of tools for analyzing texts and speeches, known as Critical Discourse Analysis – linguistic approach, developed by a number of scholars, such as Fairclough, van Dijk, van Leeuwen, Caldas-Coulthard, and others. Language is constantly used in everyday life to “highlight, silence and shape qualities of people, the world, and events.” (Hansen & Machin; 2013) CDA, as it is defined by Fairclough and Wodak, sees media discourse - “the broader ideas communicated by a text are referred to as discourses” (Hansen & Machin; 2013) - as a form of social practice, which implies two-ways dialectical situation, when “the discursive event is shaped by the situation, institution and social constructors, but it also shapes them.” (Hansen & Machin; 2013) While using the language, we do not simply name things, but conceptualize them. Therefore, discursive practices may have an ideological effect: produce and reproduce power relations between social or ethnic groups. In a way, CDA is a form of intervention in social practice and social relationships. (Fairclough & Wodak; 2011)

Teun van Dijk points out the difference between CDA, classical linguistics, and semiotics. Both of them make a distinction between the form (significant) and meaning (signifiers) of signs, however, discourse analysis recognizes that texts are vastly more complex, and “require separate though interrelated accounts of the phonetic, graphical, phonological, morphological, syntactic, micro- and macro-semantic, stylistic, superstructure, rhetorical, pragmatic, interactional, and other structures and strategies.” (Jensen and others; 2013) It is important to remember, that CDA is not limited to textual analysis, but may include relations between text and talk, text and visuals, and incorporate historical or social context into the analysis.

Of course, CDA mainly focuses on the text, spoken or written, including visuals, their relationships with other texts, the context, the utilized language and the role these texts play in the society. As a qualitative method, discourse analysis helps to understand social

interactions and how social reality is produced, through talks, texts, and images – through discourses. (Berger; 2015) There are several essential characteristics of CDA.

- CDA allows a more systematic analysis of text and language to reveal how speakers and authors use language and grammar to create meaning to “persuade people to think about events in a particular way, sometimes even seek to manipulate these people.” (Fairclough & Wodak; 1995)
- It offers the tools to show what features of the language and language choices have been used to accomplish particular communicative aims.
- It provides a number of instruments to reveal the ideas, values, and opinions in texts that may not be obvious at first. It seeks in the first place to be critical of the way that language is used for particular purposes. “In fact, there is no neutral way to represent the world through language as all the words we use are motivated and are laden with certain kind of meanings and values.” (Fairclough & Wodak; 1995) Language, for CDA, is not a simple neutral instrument of communication but “a means of social construction.” (Fairclough & Wodak; 1995)
- CDA primarily focuses on the way “social power abuse, dominance, and inequality is enacted, reproduced, and resisted by text and talk in the social and political context.” (Fairclough & Wodak; 1995) Essential for critical discourse analysis is the clear awareness of their role in society.
- CDA aims to critically investigate social inequalities as it is expressed, and constituted by language use. In other words, “CDA may be defined as fundamentally concerned with analyzing opaque as well as transparent structural relationships of dominance, discrimination, power, and control as manifested in language.” (Wodak & Meyer; 2009)

Thus, the process of CDA involves looking at choices of words and grammar in order to discover the underlying discourses. For instance, immigrants are a threat to a national culture as a discourse associated with the notion that there are a unified nation and identifiable national identity and culture. Van Leeuwen and Wodak suggest thinking about discourses as including a different kind of participants, behaviors, goals, values and locations. Fairclough explains that such discourses as national unity, racial or cultural

superiority represent certain values and ideas and contribute to the reproduction of social life. In other words, the language we utilize to describe the social world around us, influence the society we create. (Hansen & Machin; 2013)

Methodology of CDA

Fairclough and Wodak remind scholars that CDA is not “discrete academic discipline with a relatively fixed set of research methods.” (Van Dijk; 2011) On the contrary, the best way to describe CDA is as “a problem-oriented interdisciplinary research movement, subsuming a variety of approaches.” (Van Dijk; 2011)

CDA is a qualitative approach, which provides a loose set of tools that can be used to analyze written text or speech. The analysts discuss linguistic and grammatical features that they feel are significant in order to explain their meaning. It allows producing a systematic analysis of the text, pointing to linguistic and grammatical features intending to draw out the ideology of the text and hidden meanings. (Hansen & Machin; 2013) Teun A. van Dijk emphasizes several levels of CDA:

Local and global coherence. Discourse analysis is primarily focused on meaning: what this text talks about; what does it mean; what implications does it have. Partially, answers to this question are given in text semantics. One of the important notions, which is studied in text semantics, is *the local coherence of the text*: how are the subsequent proportions of the text bound together (by relations of time, condition, cause, and consequence)? *Global coherence* is what we all intuitively know as themes or topics. Topics contextually summarize the text and specify its most valuable information. Usually, in the media, the top of this macro-structures are conventionally expressed in the headline and the lead paragraph. *Implications.* This is one of the most powerful semantic notions. Much of the information of the text is not explicitly expressed but left implicit: textual expressions may imply concepts or propositions which may be assumed by background knowledge. The analysis of ‘unsaid’ is sometimes more revealing than the story of what is actually expressed in the text. There are various types of implications: entailments, presuppositions, and weaker forms, such as suggestions and associations. The well-known example in news reports about minorities is the use of irrelevant ethnic or racial labels in crime stories.

Superstructure schema. Journalistic stories, especially news stories, follow a hierarchical schema, consisting of such categories as a headline, lead (together forming a summary), main events, context, history, verbal reaction, and comments. The most important information is expressed first: the top-down strategy so-called relevance structure to the text.

Style and rhetoric. Stylistic choices also have clear social and ideological implications and often signal the opinions of the journalist about news as well as properties of the social and communicative situations, for instance, that a specific journalist is white, or middle-class. The syntax of sentences is another aspect of style. For instance, when agents of negative actions (authorities) are left out.

Sociocultural context. Discourse analysis of media narratives is not limited to textual structures. There are various underlying meaning and opinions behind the text. To discover how these underlying meanings relate to the text, we need to analyze the cognitive, social, and political contexts. “The cognitive approach is premised on the fact that text does not ‘have’ meanings, but are assigned meanings by language users.” (Van Dijk; 1985) Language users have a unique, personal representation of the news events referred by the text. A situation model represents what a language user has understood of the event that the text is about. We have understood the text if we can build a mental model of that event. A context model is a specific kind of mental model of the communicative context, which features information about the goals of discourse, its communicative acts, and properties of the audience. The context model manages interactional, communicative aspects of discourse and which relates discourse with social situation and structures. “If the news report is ‘biased,’ this is usually because the mental model of the journalist features structures and opinions which favor a specific ideological perspective on an event.” (Van Dijk; 1985)

In sum, at various levels of analysis discussed previously, such as local and global semantics, abstract schema, and style, we find a consistent pattern of discursive features and signal the ideological position of the media in the account of this event.

Chapter 4. Methodological Design of the Research

This fourth chapter provides an overview of the analytical framework of the research. Firstly, it is focusing on the selection criteria that help identify suitable empirical material for the analysis. It further provides a concise overview of the four selected newspapers, describing a brief historical background, thematic focus, as well as ownership structures. Finally, a description of the methodological frame is provided in this chapter, which is to a great extent is based on earlier works of Teun A. van Dijk on the racial and minority discourse in the print media.

4.1 Selection of the empirical material for the analysis

For the purpose of this research four Russian major quality broadsheet newspapers are selected. All newspapers have daily nation-wide distribution and acknowledgeable across the country. Their main focus is in the areas of the foreign policy of Russia, the performance of state government, foreign affairs, and broader domestic agendas, which is the concern of the whole country and some particular regions. Selection criteria:

- For the purpose of the analysis, only Russian national-wide newspapers represented online are selected.
- Selected newspapers represent the quality media in the country, acknowledge high standards of journalistic practices; represent the journalistic attempts to approaching news agenda. Even though, selected newspapers belong to one group of quality dailies, they have slight variations in audiences and editorial specializations.
- The important principle of selection is a differentiation with regard to ownership structures: selected newspapers represent the variety of property patterns (state-owned, privately owned, etc.).

4.2 Choice of samples

All selected for the analysis newspapers are quality daily broadsheets with nation-wide distribution, but different orientation, focus, and ownership structure. Four newspapers are analyzed based on the content of their websites on the topics regarding refugee crisis in Europe, during January 2016 — December 2016, which comprises of 148 articles in total. This period has chosen as the most sensitive time of the current refugee crisis when the highest number of people fleeing to Europe was registered.

Kommersant, 120 000 copies

Kommersant (www.kommersant.ru) is the first Russian business daily newspaper and a leading business broadsheet in the country. The newspaper was set up in 1989 as a continuation of the tradition of the original newspaper *Kommersant* which was published from 1909 to 1917 when it ceased publication “for a reason beyond the editorial control” (www.kommersant.ru) - because of the October revolution in Russia. The paper was described as “one of the most authoritative and influential publications for Russia’s decision-makers.” (www.kommersant.ru) It covers finance, business, foreign affairs, internal politics, culture, sports, hi-tech, science. The newspaper has 16 regional offices in Russia and one international Russian-language edition in the UK. The audience of the newspaper is predominantly male with higher education, businessmen, and top managers with high average income (www.kommersant.ru)

Ownership: Kommersant was re-established under its founder Vladimir Yakovlev – a journalist, publisher, and businessman. As a third generation journalist, he was one of the founders of the Post-Soviet journalism school in Russia. He established the Kommersant Publishing House and remained editor-in-chief from 1989 till 1999. In 1997, Boris Berezovskiy, financial mogul and owner of Aeroflot Russian Airlines at that time, became the new owner of Kommersant Publishing House. In August 2006, the paper was bought by the current owner Alisher Usmanov, a steel tycoon, head of Gazprom’s Gazprominvestholding subsidiary, and owner of Arsenal, an English football club. (Monitoring, B.B.C.; 2008)

Novaya Gazeta, 241 700

Novaya Gazeta (www.ng.ru), which currently publishes three times a week, was established in 1993 as an independent newspaper. Often critical of the government, it specializes in covering corruption, politics, society, and culture. It is currently one of the few newspapers in Russia that substantially reports on the liberal opposition. It has been a long-standing opponent of Russian policy in Chechnya and North Caucasus during the 1990s and 2000s. Well-known journalist Anna Politkovskaya wrote for the newspaper until her assassination in 2006. Regarding the audience of the newspaper, it mainly comprises of middle-aged persons from middle-class with high education, managers, and specialists. (www.brand-pressa.ru) The newspaper is the best known for its investigative journalism. It received multiple internationally recognized awards: The Henri Nannen Prize in 2007, The Four Freedoms Award for Freedom of speech in 2012, the Freedom Award of Politiken in 2014 for the independent and critical reporting that has cost the lives of six of its journalists, Gerd Bucerius Prize for Free Press of Eastern Europe. In 2012 the newspaper received the Charlemagne Prize recognizes the outstanding effort in the formation of a European identity. The newspaper currently has offices in several cities of Russia, as well as a Russia language edition for the three Baltic countries – *Novaya Gazeta – Baltija*. (www.ng.ru)

Ownership: In 1990, the former president of the Soviet Union, Mikhail Gorbachev who helped to set up *Novaya Gazeta* in 1993. 49 percent of the stakes were purchased by the former Soviet leader Mikhail Gorbachev and wealthy businessman Alexander Lebedev in 2006. Before that, the paper was owned entirely by its staff until June 2006.

Vedomosti, 75 000 copies

The business daily *Vedomosti* is the result of collaboration between the world's leading business newspapers – the *Financial Times* and *The Wall Street Journal* – that was established in 1999. The mission of the newspaper as quoted from its website is to “provide members of the business community with timely, objective, the high-quality and useful information they need to make decisions.” (www.vedomosti.ru) *Vedomosti* provides its readers with the most up-to-date, detailed, significant economic, financial, corporate, and political information. The audience of one issue is around 238 000 persons.

Most of them are the businessman, managers, and specialists who require accurate information for decision-making. The newspaper has five regional editions and several thematic supplements.

Ownership: From 1999 the newspaper was jointly owned by Dow Jones, Financial Times and Samona Independent Media Group. In 2015, three of them sold their stakes under the new Russian media ownership law which came into force in 2016. The newspaper is now privately owned by Russian businessman Demyan Kudryavtsev – journalist, media manager and businessman, a former executive of the Kommersant Publishing House. In 2015 he purchased the assets of Sanoma Independent Media Group, including National Geographic Russia, Harvard Business Review, The Moscow Times, and Vedomosti. (www.english.imedia.ru)

Rossiyskaya Gazeta, 160 000

Rossiyskaya Gazeta is a daily broadsheet that publishes official decrees and documents of state bodies, including laws, Presidential decrees and the Governmental orders that come into force only after the publication in the newspaper. Apart from this, the newspaper provides solid coverage on the issues of economy, politics, foreign affairs, society, sport, and culture. It has its offices in 16 countries, 14 regions of Russia and publishes its issues in 44 cities on a daily basis and 47 cities of the country on a weekly basis. According to surveys on the newspaper's website, its readers are "well-balanced adults, inclined to adopt conservative views." (www.rg.ru) In 2016 it was the most frequently quoted newspaper on the Russian radio and television.

Ownership: *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* was established by the Government of the Russian Federation in November of 1990 and remain the official media source of the same state body.

4.3 Analytical frame of the discourse analysis of the refugees in Russian print media

For the purpose of this research, the approach of CDA based on earlier works on the discourse of Teun A. van Dijk is applied. The ultimate goal of the analysis is to reveal whether there are any differences in the refugee discourse and framing patterns between newspapers with different types of ownership, and to elaborate on four measurement questions:

- What constitutes the media discourse and formulates dominant frames on refugee crises in the Russian print media?
- What language does media utilize to describe the problem of the refugee crisis in the European Union and Russia?
- Who is setting the agenda and formulating the discourse?
- The analysis is based on the assumption that that the closer a newspaper's affiliation appears to governmental structures, the more the narrative reflects the ownership structures; while when the media appears further from the governmental structures the explanatory power of ownership declines, and the relative power of editorial position and specialization increases.
- It is apparent that the ownership, especially distance to governmental structures, might affect the media discourse. We should acknowledge that there are potentially multiple factors that can contribute towards influencing the discourse of media. For example, many internal documents and agreements reassure editorial independence and establish the relationships between ownership and newsroom, editors and journalists. Even in the case when media owners do not tell journalists directly what to write or whom to interview, their influence might be subtle. Thus, in reality, to reveal ownership's power over media discourse, a comprehensive socio-economic analysis, analysis of internal documents, and interviews with staff are required. However, due to the limitation of this research, we cannot study the influence of the ownership fully from these multiple perspectives. For the purposes of this research we are only concerned with

ownership in the sense of its potential influence towards the content of media. We only focus on whether the factor of ownership can be observed through the analyzed content, or if there are other factors in place. This assumption that ownership matters should lead to different framing patterns of the refugees' discourse in newspapers.

The analysis of the media content itself will be performed following two levels of analysis.

Macro level

A. Topical analysis. The goal is to find what is the hierarchy of topics of the media publications regarding the Refugee crisis. According to Teun van Dijk overall meaning of the texts consist of a hierarchically arranged “set of macro propositions,” (Van Dijk; 2015) which are derived from the meaning of the sentences. Topics are important aspects of news reporting, and crucial to analyse when it comes to minority issues, and refugee representation. Topics represent what newsmakers consider the most important aspects of news agenda. A particular feature of newspaper reporting is that topics are usually not expressed in a continuous or chronological way, but rather based on their “importance, relevance, or newsworthiness that organize news reports.” (Van Dijk; 2015) Topics influence the representation readers to construct in their minds and attitudes they maintain of specific events. There are three main levels of topic analysis:

Headline analysis. Headlines play an important textual and cognitive functions. Their main purpose is to summarize the most important information of the article or report. They usually read first by the audience and, thus, strategically used to construct the overall meaning of the topic before the text itself is read. Headlines are often used to activate a relevant memory or knowledge in reader's mind. The information provided in the headlines signals the reader how to define the event. Quite often headlines have ideological implications — they summarize what according to a journalist, editors, or a third party is the most and the least important information. The first property of the headlines that should be examined is the use of words. The choice of one word over another may signal the opinions, emotions, or social position of the report producers.

B. The analysis of subjects. A subject is a single concept, such as ‘crime’ or ‘victim,’ that derive from topics of the reporting, and stands for larger social or political domain or a complex issue. Quite often subjects may be confused with topics of a news reporting, even though they are different. Each piece of information publish in the newspaper has its unique topic; topics always refer to specific events, actions, and people. However, subjects, such as ‘immigration,’ ‘unemployment,’ ‘religion,’ ‘racial attack,’ or ‘illegality’ refer to a more general social phenomenon. (Van Dijk; 2015)

C. Analysis of textual schemata. Textual schemata refer to the structure or hierarchical organization of the news reports or features in a newspaper. Usually, news reports begin with a summary category (headline, sib-headline, lead), that summarizes the most important information. The rest of the news report contains a number of common categories, such as main events, background, context, history, previous events, consequences, comments, evaluations, and so on. However, when it comes to different types of reporting, these structural blocks may be omitted or shuffled. Schemata may manipulate the topical implication of the news, and therefore may have ideological implications. (Van Dijk; 2015)

D. Analysis of sources. Journalists engaged in various strategies to get relevant information. Many materials or ‘source text,’ such as interviews, phone calls, other media, documents, databases, books, official reports and hand-outs are used by journalists to write news reports. However, the information, and quotations, in particular, are usually particularly selected. Since most of the statements of a newsmakers are too long and complex, they are shortened and transformed by a reporter’s selection and summarization process. Quotations have several functions in the media: (i) quotations might be newsworthy itself, because they express the interpretation of opinions of relevant news actors; (ii) narrative function; (iii) quotations enhance the credibility of an accountant; (iv) quotations allow interpretations of events regarding further coming actions; (v) quotations allow subjective interpretations, explanations, or opinions. (Van Dijk; 2015) Teun van Dijk highlights that minorities often speak through mediation – more credible or accessible politicians, lawyers, action groups, and so on. The most important questions when it comes to quotation analysis are: “Who is speaking, how often and how prominently? About what are quoted news actors allowed to give their opinions?” (Van

Dijk; 2015) During the analysis, we should also draw our attention to not only to who is authorized to say what, but also how their words are presented, and who else is asked to comment on these events. (Van Dijk; 2015)

Micro 'local' level

E. Frames. The comprehension of particular sets of ideas often involves understanding through general concepts or categories. Frames are “knowledge units organized around a certain concept. But, unlike a set of associations such units contain the essential, the typical and the possible information associated with such a concept.” (van Dijk; 1977) The meaning, style, and the rhetoric of the actual sentences are an important part of the discourse analysis. Types of meaning strategies (aspects of the meaning): presupposition, implications, inferences, concealments, euphemism, disclaiming denies, blaming the victim, negativization, and a combined strategy of positive self-representation, and negative other-presentation. Perspective cannot be described through a particular word or sentences, but rather but the way rather people, or events, are described through the whole text.

Implicit meanings, or variations of biased perspective:

- ***Implications.*** Information may be inferred by language users from their experience or knowledge and combined with actual information from the text. Implications can derive from the usage of particular words instead of others.
- ***Presupposition.*** This particular forms of implications can be defined as a proposition that entailed or denied by a statement. The press might directly or indirectly state information that is suggested to be known by the readers.
- ***Vagueness.*** Typically, indirectness is used whenever it is necessary to conceal responsibility for negative actions.
- ***Overcompleteness: irrelevance.*** Stories may vary between higher and lower levels of abstractions. The level of abstraction and degree of completeness includes the most common form of overcompleteness is the categorization of the actors by color or ethnicity even when this information is irrelevant for the reporting

Chapter 5. Results of Empirical Analysis of Media Discourse

5.1 Discourse analysis of *Kommersant*

Over a span of 12 months in 2016, *Kommersant* newspaper published 19 articles dedicated to different aspects of the refugee crisis in Europe. Before going deeper into the analysis, we should note several specific characteristics of this set of articles. First, a majority of them reflect three key geopolitical areas such as Turkey, the European Union, and Russia; second, most journalistic texts touch upon political and expert discourse on refugee crisis. Thus, the newspaper reflects on higher levels of refugee crisis debates.

Macro-level

Topical analysis. Let us begin the discourse analysis of newspaper texts by distinguishing the most important topics of news reports. Headlines play an important textual and cognitive function thus they deserve special attention. The headline compound of *Kommersant* has a constant structure that changes rarely. It usually consists of a headline itself – a short 2-7 words sentence or a quote that serves the purpose to catch the attention of the audience and sub-headline – more extended sentence that conveys the most relevant information regarding the event. The articles were addressing several areas: (i) quota policies in the European Union; (ii) the role of different political parties, especially far-right coalitions, in shaping refugee agenda in their home countries; (iii) position and capacities of international organizations such as UN, Red Cross and Amnesty International in handling the crisis; (iv) the confrontation between national governments and political coalitions in shaping refugees policies in European states; (v) position and role of Russia facilitating the crisis and so on. Based on headline analysis we can distinguish three leading topical lines of the news reporting: (A) debates around migration policy of Germany; (B) role of Russia in the immigration crisis; (C) anti-migration rhetoric in Europe with regard to Austria and Hungary; and (D) the role of international organizations – UN and Red Cross. Another three articles, dedicated to the role of Turkey, and Russian soft-power in Syria and interruption of humanitarian aid and organize a separate group.

Subject analysis. Let us briefly analyze the subject frequency in the articles of the newspaper. For the first group of articles, discussing the role of Germany and its migration policy, the primary issues were ‘crimes,’ ‘Islamic terrorism,’ ‘migrant attacks,’ and ‘migration flows.’ Newspaper reports were mainly discussing the attacks that happened in Koln during the summer of 2016 and how Germany’s immigration policy will change after that. Concerning the second and third group of articles, the most frequent subject repetitions were ‘migrant flows’ and ‘border control.’ In the articles about Hungary and Austria, there is a clear emphasis on far-right rhetoric and anti-migration policy proposals. Concerning the fourth group, the subjects are ‘escaping from war’ and ‘solidarity crisis.’ Voices from international organizations tried to emphasize a clear lack of ideas on how to handle the crisis and the absence of a standard policy within the EU. In sum, the selection of articles represents a relatively narrow range of topics. Most of them emphasize the perception of the refugee crisis as a problem while countries that face it have no long-term action plan how to handle the crisis. Their responses are not coordinated and encouraged by xenophobic attitudes. All subjects have a negative connotation and represent refugees as a threat and unwanted actors that other countries have to deal with.

Textual schemata. The selection of articles represents a quite diverse variety in types of journalistic text such as news stories, features, analytical articles, interviews and opinion pieces. As genres of editorial writing are important for the discourse analysis, let us describe them briefly. Five types of narrative models were utilized by the newspaper while covering refugee topics. A *news story* is a short journalistic piece consisting of the most relevant information regarding the event. A *feature* story, as a quite similar to the news story, rooted in the report on a newsworthy event. However, it delivers more details, comments from different sides of the conflict and contextual background; *the analytical article* is a long-read that address the conflict from multiple sides and gives an in-depth representation of cases. The goal is to give a voice to different sides of the conflict, provide a deep analysis, supported by an expert comment and to draw possible solution from the crisis. *The opinion piece* is a type of text that gives a voice to opinion leaders or experts in the society, such as political leaders, scientists, or well-established journalists and editors. This variety of journalistic texts helps to cover the topic from different perspectives.

News reports, short informative pieces, consisting of four parts: (a) headline + sub-headline where the main idea of the article, based on editorial understanding of the matter, described; (b) lead — an introductory paragraph that aims at answering the question ‘what happened?’; (c) details — 2-4 paragraphs of detailed information on the event, chronology and leading actors; (d) background – a supportive paragraph that put a describing event in a broader context; (e) a quote or an expert’s opinion – a concluding paragraph that gives an alternative opinion or expert assessment of the event and its consequences in the future. We shall note, that all news reports in the newspaper are built following the standard schemata of news writing for quality media.

Feature is an extended news report or a discussion around an event that recently happened. It has same structural bodies of the text as news report. However, it is a longer and more in-depth piece representing more sides of the conflict, opinions, and comments. It also gives more details and background information than a news report. The news reports and features are the most popular types of journalistic text in the newspaper. These short and concise informative pieces aim at describing the event, in brief, providing necessary background and commentaries.

The next type of journalistic text is an *analytical article* which aims at providing a comprehensive overview of a conflict or problem. In principle, these kinds of texts consist of three parts (apart from headline, sub-headline, and lead that are typical for all texts in the newspaper): descriptive background where journalist put a problem in the context; explaining its origins and importance for the society; representation of the position 1; description of the position 2. Articles of this type are small in numbers in the newspaper. They provide a more detailed explanation of the problem, representing different sides of it. However, they do not consist of any solutions or expert position on the matter.

The last two types of text are *expert interview* and *opinion piece*. They have several characteristics in: (a) absence of the fixed structure — texts are structured following the author’s writing style; (b) presentation of the critical opinion. All interviews in the newspaper reflect the position of prominent figures and opinion leaders on the refugee agenda in the region, such as Pascal Kutta – a chairman of the International Committee of the Red Cross, Leidulv Namtvedt — the Norwegian Ambassador in Moscow; Stefan

Mayer — representative of the Christian Social Union in Bavaria; Filippo Gandi — United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. The only opinion article is written by Ban Ki-moon, the Secretary-General of the United Nations, as an open letter to the readers of the newspaper.

Information sources. All the primary information sources used by journalists of the newspaper are official. Among them are the head of ministry of internal affairs of Germany - Joachim Herrmann, vice-chairman of the Christian Democratic Union in Germany - Franz Josef Jung, representative of the Christian Social Union in Bavaria - Stefan Mayer, prime minister of Bavaria - Horst Lorenz Seehofer, Federal minister of transport and digital infrastructure of Germany - Alexander Dobrindt, Prime Minister of Hungary – Viktor Orban, Deputy Minister of Internal Affairs of Greece - Ioannis Mouzalas, Norwegian Ambassador to Russia – Leidulv Namtvedt, and other European politicians. Supranational actors such as Secretary-General of the United Nations - Ban Ki-moon; chairman of the International Committee of the Red Cross – Pascal Kutta; President of the European Commission — Jean-Claude Juncker, representative of European Commission – Natasha Bertolotti, and others. The newspaper often refers to the researchers for commentary and prognosis. Among them are the head of German studies of the Institute of Europe of Russian Academy of Science - Vladislav Belov, analytic of the Republican Foundation for Science Education and Research – Caba Tot; expert of European security of the Institute of Europe, Russian Academy of Science – Dmitry Danilov, and others. Moreover, the newspaper often refers to media sources such as *Der Spiegel*, *Der Tagesspiegel*, *Muenchner Merkur*, *Bild*. Some of the sources are not mentioned, especially regarding the data and figures that are used by journalists. In some occasions, sources are mentioned vaguely ('authorities and law enforcement agencies of the country,' 'police of Munchen,' etc.).

Micro-level

Let us have a closer look at the semantics of the discourse based on topical categories of the texts and images of the refugees and migrants that newspaper is presenting.

A. Refugees are a cause or crimes and terrorism. When it comes to the portrayal of refugees, their presence in the country becomes associated with the increasing number of

crimes and terrorist attacks. Migrants are portrayed as a source of Islamic terrorism. The article *'Incidental law'* (published in *Kommersant* #133) highlights that some representatives from communities of migrants who committed crimes belong to Islamic State. "State and society live waiting for a terrorist attack. Any event happened will be affiliated with refugees and migrants."¹ "There are hundreds of thousands of potential criminals in the country."² However, later on, journalist affiliate all Islamic migrants as a potential source of Islamist terrorism and a threat to any Christian country: "...A potential target of the 'Jihad warriors' is any European Christian state."³ Many times journalists pointed out that those who commit crimes have psychological deviations which will lead to increasing insecurity in the society. "In all four cases, tourists and citizens of German cities were killed by people came from Islamic countries. They exported their intolerance, hatred, increasing susceptibility, complexes and psychical deviations on the German soil."⁴

Several articles of the newspaper present the European populist response to the crisis. In the articles *'Refugees will receive a protest note'* (published in *Kommersant* #32), the newspaper is quoting the German tabloid Bild "Uncontrolled flow of migrants in Europe will be followed by terrorism, crimes, antisemitism, and homophobia, - claimed Hungarian prime minister Viktor Orban."⁵

B. Migrants are a threat to the stability of political system of the EU. In the article *'Angela Merkel and her associates break up at the border'* (published in *Kommersant* #7) the president of the European Commission concluded that the refugee crisis might question the existence of the European Union. "Survival risks are hung over the Schengen area: today some propose to increase border control, and tomorrow they will start to question whether we need a common currency if we do not have a freedom of movement within the internal market."⁶

¹ Kommersant #133. Incidental law: a series of attacks, committed by migrants, forces Germany to change policy and laws. Published 26.07.2016. URL: <http://kommersant.ru/doc/3047559>

² Ibid

³ Ibid

⁴ Ibid

⁵ Kommersant #32. Refugees will receive a protest note: Hungary, Austria and Balkan countries look for a way to restrain a flow of migrants. Published 26.02.2016. URL: <https://kommersant.ru/doc/2923881>

⁶ Kommersant #7. Angela Merkel and her associates break up at the border: the ruling coalition criticizes an immigration policies of Germany's chancellor. Published 20.01.2016. URL: <https://kommersant.ru/doc/2896328>

Another popular idea within this groups is that the migration crisis may lead to a drastic change in the politics of Germany. Journalists highlighted that popularity of the ruling party, and Angela Merkel dropped drastically during the “series of summer crimes committed by Migrants”⁷ and in the future she might have opponents within her coalition. “Three crimes out of four happen in Bavaria where the Christian Democratic Union – the partner of the ruling coalition and Angela Merkel — is in power. Its leaders are more skeptical towards migration flow which may create problems for Frau Merkel in the future.”⁸

In sum, articles of this group reflect on refugee crisis as a far-reaching problem for Germany and Europe. Germany is taking a leading position in handling the migration flow however it leads to deepening the internal crisis in the country. Migrants are presented from only one side — as a threat to national security and a potential source of Islamic terrorism, while issues of integration are not discussed.

C. Refugees are not welcomed in Russia. Articles of this group aimed at describing the ways Russia is dealing with the refugee crisis. Articles emphasize the resistance of the country to accept refugees even in smaller numbers, as well as a negative public opinion towards refugees in the society. One of the articles, ‘*We consider Russia an overall safe country*’ (published in *Kommersant* #17), describes the debate around the Russian-Norwegian border. For an extended period of 2015 Russia border control let to undocumented migrants leave to Norway which created a critical situation on the Norwegian border. The language of this interview with the Ambassador of Norway in Russia is quite incriminating and does not contain any negative connotations regarding the image of migrants. However, it describes Russia as being resistant to accepting refugees or even helping them escape from Russia and illegally cross Russian-Norwegian border. “We think that migrants appear illegally on the territory of Norway and should be returned to Russia.”⁹ “A smaller number of them, around 5,6 thousand, are holders of Russian visas or residency permit and can legally remain on the territory of Russian

⁷ Kommersant #32. Refugees will receive a protest note: Hungary, Austria and Balkan countries look for a way to restrain a flow of migrants. Published 26.02.2016. URL: <https://kommersant.ru/doc/2923881>

⁸ Ibid

⁹ Kommersant, #17. We consider Russia an overall safe country: Norwegian ambassador tells about the debate with Russian authorities concerning refugees. Published 03.02.2016. URL: <https://kommersant.ru/doc/2906699>

Federation. Thus they have to be returned to Russia <...> When we started returning them, Russian side stopped receiving them. <...> — How Moscow explains that? — By considerations of security, but they do not specify what does it mean. However, right now this issue is under review.”¹⁰

The article *‘Russians became less sympathetic towards refugees from the Middle East’* (published in *Kommersant* #20) describes the recent opinion poll that was conducted by the Public Opinion Foundation and revealed a negative social attitude towards refugees. “Currently only 16 % thinks that the EU should receive illegal migrants, 67% suggest to send them back to the Middle East. In September 39% supported the idea that Europe should close its borders, however right now the number has risen to 60%. The number of those who think that Europe should accept all migrants declined from 42% till 23%.”¹¹ Moreover, 58% of participants believe that Russia does not have economic opportunities to receive migrants.

The article *‘Escaping to Russia is the last thing to do’* (published in *Kommersant* #87) covers the Amnesty International report about the most refugee tolerant countries. The expert explains Russia’s position at the bottom of the list: “Reports of all of the state TV channels are full of horrible stories about migrants. They say of Europe as it is ready to collapse under the migrant flow. Many people believe to this propaganda.”¹²

D. Refugees as victims. Ban Ki-moon – the Secretary-General of the United Nations – wrote the article *‘It is not a crisis of a great number of refugees, it is a crisis of solidarity’* (published in *Kommersant* #87) in the form of an open letter to the audience of the newspaper. The article reflects on human rights and emphasizes that every country should take its responsibilities. “Millions of people are harshly suffering. Thousands died in the Mediterranean, in waters of the Andaman Sea, in Saleh and Central America. Refugees and migrants are no different from us. They are diverse.”¹³ The article reflects on the unpopular idea that receiving countries are benefiting from accepting refugees. The

¹⁰ Kommersant, #17. We consider Russia an overall safe country: Norwegian ambassador tells about the debate with Russian authorities concerning refugees. Published 03.02.2016. URL: <https://kommersant.ru/doc/2906699>

¹¹ Kommersant, #20. They do not want them here and do not suggest to Europe: Russians became less sympathetic towards refugees from the Middle East, Published 08.02.2016. URL: <http://kommersant.ru/doc/2911207>

¹² Kommersant #87. Escaping to Russia is the last thing to do. Published 20.05.2016. URL: <http://kommersant.ru/doc/2990917>

¹³ Ibid

author stated that the EU is facing a lack of solidarity and deep political crisis. “Refugees and migrants do not represent a threat. On the contrary, they contribute significantly to the hosting country and the countries of their origin. The better they are integrated, the more they contribute to the new society.”¹⁴

In conclusion, the newspaper uses terms ‘refugee’ and ‘migrant’ interchangeably as synonyms, not making any distinction between them. However, when it comes to defining the crisis it is always a ‘migration crisis’ – never ‘refugee crisis.’ It might be explained by the norms of Russian language and absence of precise definitions, like ‘asylum seeker.’ For instance, the phrase ‘миграционный кризис’ (‘migration crisis’) is used regarding both immigration and refugee crisis. However, the reason is additionally specified. For instance, ‘миграционный кризис, обусловленный притоком беженцев’ – ‘migration crisis due to the refugee flow.’

Kommersant’s reflection on the refugee crisis is based on the high level of the political debate in Europe. Primary sources of information are political leaders or representatives of the European countries (mainly Germany, Hungary, Austria, and Norway), supra-institutional authorities, experts, and analytics as well as media sources. Based on the analyzed articles, the newspaper did not portray the voices of refugees themselves. The language that is utilized by the publication is discrete and balanced, with the exception of several articles reflecting on the rise far-right rhetoric in Eastern Europe where newspaper employed more offensive language in direct quotations of politicians. However, the overall image of the refugees represented in the publication is negative. Refugees are portrayed as problematic and unwanted in Europe and Russia; they create problems, social tensions, commit crimes and increase insecurity.

¹⁴ *Kommersant* #87. It is not a crisis of a great number of refugees, it is a crisis of solidarity. Published 20.05.2016
URL: <https://kommersant.ru/doc/2990885>

5.2 Discourse analysis of *Vedomosti*

Business daily *Vedomosti* published 20 articles on the topics relate to the refugee crisis during the 12 months of 2016. The majority of articles are short news pieces that touch upon political debates around the refugee crisis as well as its economic impact on the European discourse.

Macro-level

Topical analysis. We shall begin the discourse analysis with identifying main topics within the newspaper's narrative. The analysis of the headline complexes (headline, sub-headline, and lead) shows the domination of the three dominant themes.

- (i) *The role of Turkey in the resolution of the refugee crisis.* This category of articles consists of short news pieces (3-5 paragraphs each) that examine the EU-Turkey agreement of accepting migrants; violation of human rights; conditions, based on which Turkey receives new migrants. Turkey represents as a strategic partner of the EU, however, being dangerous and unpredictable in its actions.
- (ii) *Crimes committed by refugees in Germany.* A short news report informs the readers about main episodes of crimes that were perpetrated by refugees during summer 2016.
- (iii) *Debates occurring around possible resolutions of the humanitarian crisis.* Analytical and opinion articles are discussing the legislation and migration policies of the European countries and the European Union; the role of supranational organizations such as the United Nations and the Red Cross; the leading role of Germany in the resolution of the refugee crisis.

Subject analysis. The frequency of subjects shows bigger overarching concepts that stand behind social and political issues. A subject analysis demonstrates that the most popular subjects within the newspaper are 'victims,' 'invaders,' and 'mass of people.' Refugees are represented as victims of the war in Syria as well as inhumane actions of Turkey (in

the article *'Turkey shoots Syrian refugees at the border'*¹⁵). They also presented as an uncontrolled mass of people that are floating to Europe ('millions of migrants,' 'refugee flow,' 'new wave of refugees'). Articles of this group discuss Greece and Austria sending refugees who crossed borders illegally to Turkey. However, Turkey sends some of them back to Syria. Examples of the refugees presented as 'criminals', and 'terrorists' can be found in the articles *'Syrian refugee armed with machete killed one and stabbed two in Germany'*¹⁶ and *'Syrian exploded himself in Bavaria belongs to ISIS.'*¹⁷ Therefore, migrants are presented as an overall threat to the state security of the European countries.

Textual schemata. There are two types of articles used by the newspaper while covering the issues of the refugee crisis – short news reports and expert analysis.

- (i) *Short news reports* consist of a headline and two-three paragraphs of text. The headline is supposed to attract the attention of the reader with concise reporting regarding the event. The first paragraph summarizes a primary information of the news piece, while the third paragraph provides either important details of the event or necessary background. All news articles are written based on the information from information agencies or other media (newspapers, TV channels). Thus, news reports are usually not original or unique.
- (ii) *Expert opinion* is a longer text format that represents the attempt of a comprehensive analysis of the event. It is hard to distinguish common textual schemata since each text follows its own structural logic; however, certain common elements are in place in all of them: an explanation of the problem, supported by facts and figures; representation of the position of different sides of the conflict, analysis, and discussion. Even though stories of this type might include a comprehensive overview from multiple sides they remain strongly opinionated, and therefore represent the position of an expert rather than balanced analysis.

¹⁵ Vedomosti. The Times: Turkey shots Syrian refugees at the border. Published 31.03.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/03/31/635853-turtsiya-rasstreliivaet-bezhentsev>

¹⁶ Vedomosti. Syrian refugee armed with machete killed one and stabbed two in Germany'. Published 24.07.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/07/24/650344-siriiskii-bezhenets>

¹⁷ Vedomosti. Syrian refugee who set off a bomb explorer belongs to ISIS. Published 25.07.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/07/25/650483-utroivshii-vzriv-bavarii-siriets-okazalsya-storonnikom-ig>

The popularity of two above mentioned text formats shows, first of all, the insignificance of the topic of refugee crisis for the newspaper. *Vedomosti* almost does not make an attempt at conducting a journalistic analysis of the migration crisis; it does not represent different sides of the conflict, principal actors, decision makers, or victims of the crisis. Journalistic representation of the conflict lacks from expert assessment, which ideally should be unbiased. Thus, a clear lack of editorial resources of the newspaper dedicated to the analyzing the refugee crisis mirrors the small variations of text genres.

Information Sources. The scope of information sources represents a small variety of informants. Most of the articles are short news reports based on the information from one source. Most of them are media sources such as *The Times*; *BBC*; Turkish newspaper *Hurriyet*; German information sources *Die Welt*, *Bild*, *Deutsche Welle*, *AFP*, *DPA*; Austrian newspaper *Österreich*; news channel *CBS*. The newspaper also refers to the information agencies such as Interfax; Reuters; TASS. It utilizes information from international organizations like Amnesty International; the UN, and the Red Cross. Several articles are based on expert opinions such as the deputy director of the Russian International Affairs Council or director of the Institute of the Migration Policy in Berlin. The sources analysis shows that *Vedomosti* utilizes the narrowest range of information sources among all newspapers. Aside from the information from other media and reports of international organizations, it provides very few examples of original journalistic sources.

Micro-level

Let us have a closer look at the semantics of the discourse based on topical categories of the texts and images of the refugees and migrants that the newspaper is presenting.

A. Refugees are victims. In the majority of the publications of the newspaper, refugees are portrayed as a victim of multiple causes or as some easily manipulative figures that other actors use for their own purposes. Turkey is supposed to be a strategic partner of the European Union for accepting refugees, however in the article '*Turkey shoots refugees on the border*' (published in *Vedomosti* on 31.03.2016), refugees are presented as some innocent victims of the country's actions. "Turkish border guards are shooting refugees

who are fleeing from the war in Syria.”¹⁸ “During the last four months, 16 migrants including three children shot dead.”¹⁹ Moreover, the article specified that the EU made an agreement with Ankara, based on which the country recognized as “safe third country for refugees.”²⁰

Another article *‘Turkey sends to Syria 100 refugees daily’* (published in *Vedomosti* on 01.04.2016) relies on the reports of Amnesty International. Turkey has been accused of violating international humanitarian law, which makes the agreement between Turkey and the EU look even more suspicious. “Human rights organizations are concerned that the Agreement [between the EU and Turkey], that comes into force on the 4th of April and suppose to slow down the refugee flow in Europe, violate human rights and questions whether Turkey is a safe country.”²¹

Refugees are portrayed as victims, globally, even living in asylum in safe countries. For instance, in the article *‘Unknown assailant sprays gas in crowd of refugees’* (published in *Vedomosti* on 09.01.2016) they are presented as targets easy to attack. “Around 30 Syrian refugees got injured in Vancouver, Canada. While a group of refugees was leaving a Muslim Centre, an unknown person sprayed a pepper gas while passing by on a bicycle.”²² Moreover, refugees represented as political victims of terrorists (referring to the Islamic State) and Russia. The article *‘Merkel refuses to close border for migrants’* (published in *Vedomosti* on 28.07.2016) discusses the series of attacks committed by migrants in Germany. Islamic terrorists commit attacks under refugee’s names to undermine public attitudes towards them. “Terror-acts in Germany were determined to spread fear and hatred between our cultures and religious.”²³

The article *‘Syrian refugees became a weapon of Moscow’* (published in *Vedomosti* on 02.03.2016) shows how immigrants became a political tool that has been used by different

¹⁸ Vedomosti. The Times: Turkey shoots refugees on the border. Published 31.03.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/03/31/635853-turtsiya-rasstrelivaet-bezhentsev>

¹⁹ Ibid

²⁰ Ibid

²¹ Vedomosti. Amnisti Internationa: Turkey sends to Syria 100 refugees daily. Published 01.04.2016 URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/04/01/636042-amnesty-international>

²² Vedomosti. Unknown assailant sprays gas in crowd of refugees. Published 09.01.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/01/09/623370-neizvestnij>

²³ Vedomosti. Merkel refuses to close border for migrants. Published 28.07.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/articles/2016/07/28/650929-merkel-otkazalas-zakrit>

political actors to pursue their interests. “Russia and Assad’s regime consciously turn migrants into a weapon, trying to undermine European structures and break courage of Europe.”²⁴

B. Refugees are not welcomed in Europe. This group of articles represents migrants as ‘unwanted’ or ‘unwelcomed’ in many European countries, such as Greece, Macedonia, or Austria or even in the EU. The article ‘*Greece began to deport refugees to Turkey*’ (published in *Vedomosti* on 04.04.2016) discusses the agreement between the EU and Turkey and shows that neither Greece nor Turkey want refugees on their territories. “Greece started the deportations of migrants who tried to escape to the EU back to Turkey following the plan approved by the European Union.”²⁵ The article uses terms ‘illegal immigrant’ and ‘illegal border crossers’ when referring to refugees.

However, particular reasons for not wanting migrants in a country are not necessarily explained. Sometimes it is just assumed that they are ‘bad’ without providing a particular argument for deporting them. For instance, the article ‘*Austria wants to send Syrian refugees back to Turkey*’ (published in *Vedomosti* on 06.02.2016) differentiates between ‘migrants’ and ‘refugees’; however, they all are the subject for deportation, regardless of the reason of immigration. “Austria wants the European border guard agency Frontex to send refugees and migrants from Syria back to Turkey.”²⁶ The article ‘*Media reports on new restrictions for refugees to enter Macedonia*’ (published in *Vedomosti* on 06.03.2016) shortly inform the readers that only refugees fleeing from the war zones will be allowed in the country: “Macedonia introduced additional restrictions for refugees who tries to enter the country through the border with Greece.”²⁷

Articles of this group predominantly represent refugees as ‘illegal migrants.’ However, this term is never specified and what exactly the newspaper means by that remains unclear. Refugees are unwanted for unclear reasons – articles do not specify the intentions

²⁴ Vedomosti. NATO: Syrian refugees became a weapon of Moscow. Published 02.03.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/03/02/632174-nato-bezhentsi-rossii>

²⁵ Vedomosti. Greece begun to deport refugees to Turkey. Published 04.04.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/04/04/636278-greetsiya-nachala-deportirovat>

²⁶ Vedomosti. Austria wants to send Syrian refugees back to Turkey. Published 06.02.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/02/06/627461-avstriya>

²⁷ Vedomosti. Media reports on new restrictions for refugees to enter Macedonia. Published 06.03.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/03/06/632657-smi>

behind actions of countries. All articles emphasize the idea of sending ‘unwanted’ refugees from European countries back to Turkey. However, Turkey does not have a desire to keep them in the country, sending them back to Syria or Germany.

C. Helping refugees. Turkey remains the central country when the newspaper is discussing the refugee crisis. Alongside its brutal actions towards refugees, it is also presented as a humanitarian partner of the EU. The articles ‘*Erdogan announced a possibility to grant residency permit for refugees*’ (published in *Vedomosti* on 30.07.2016) discusses the idea proposed by President Erdogan to give Turkish residency to the refugees: “we rescue our brothers and sisters by giving them an opportunity to receive a residency of the country.”²⁸ The article does not specify the rules and procedures based on which people will be able to obtain a residency, leaving open many questions. Another article, ‘*Turkey keeps accepting refugees*’ (published in *Vedomosti* on 07.02.2016), discusses that even though the country almost reached the limits, it will keep accepting refugees: “After all these people have nothing else to do: they will either die under bombings and Turkey, alongside with the rest of the World, will peacefully watch them dying, or we will open our borders for them.”²⁹

Germany is represented as the only European country accommodating and welcoming refugees, understanding it as a ‘historical duty’ of Germany. The article ‘*Merkel refuses to close Germany for refugees*’ (published in *Vedomosti* on 28.07.2016) states that: “The German chancellor Angela Merkel categorically rejected the call to change the policy towards migrants, despite series of attacks committed by refugees.”³⁰

Based on the discourse analysis one may conclude that the refugee crisis is not a central topic for the newspaper. First, most of the articles are short information pieces based on the information from other media sources. The newspaper does not provide an in-depth independent analysis of the events. As a result, there is an absence of variations of journalistic forms of texts, such as interview, investigation, analytical article, feature, or

²⁸ Vedomosti. ‘Erdogan announced a possibility to grant residency permit for refugees. Published 30.07.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/07/03/647723-erdogan-zayavil>

²⁹ Vedomosti. Turkey keeps accepting refugees. Published 07.02.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/02/07/627692-turtsiya-prodolzhit>

³⁰ Vedomosti. Merkel refuses to close Germany for refugees. Published 28.07.2016. URL: <http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/articles/2016/07/28/650929-merkel-otkazalas-zakrit>

expert comment. Second, refugees are presented as a phenomenon or by numbers ('flow of migrants,' 'millions of people') however no explanation who are these people, what problems are they facing is given. Refugees are presented as those who cross borders illegally and 'unwanted' in many countries. The issues that newspaper rises are fragmental. For example, it mentioned the response of Greece and Macedonia. However, there is no discussion on the response of Central European states versus Western European countries. Third, it introduces Turkey as playing the central role in the crisis however the role of the EU is undermined. There are simply no discussions around European policy towards refugees. As well, the role of Russia is not presented at all – the refugee crisis is portrayed as an external problem against Russia. Thus, coverage of the refugee crisis of the newspaper is not coherent or considered. Already based on the sources of information the assumption that the topic of the refugee crisis is a peripheral for the newspapers can be made. *Vedomosti* utilizes very few original sources of information. Most of the articles refer to the information from another media sources, thus not original.

5.3 Discourse analysis of *Novaya Gazeta*

During 2016 the newspaper published 32 articles regarding the issues of the refugee crisis. The coverage contains many differences compared to the other analyzed newspapers. First, it substantially discusses the role of Russia in the refugee crisis. Second, the publication provides a meaningful and deep journalistic analysis of the situations. Third, it makes sure that the voices of the real people – victims of war in Syria – are heard. Finally, *Novaya Gazeta*, in comparison to *Kommersant* and *Vedomosti*, applies a substantially different approach while covering the crisis. The idea is to reflect on how the policies and decisions made by political leaders affect lives of real human beings.

Macro level

Topical analysis. The ‘introductory compound’ of each article (headline, sub-headline, and lead) contains more descriptive words, or even emotional connotations, comparing to the very strict way to approach headlines in *Kommersant* and *Vedomosti*. For instance, the headline ‘*Ticket to Aleppo. Russia does not deport Syrian refugees, it just ignores them*’ (published in *Novaya Gazeta* #123)³¹ shows the criticism of Russia’s policy towards Syrian refugees. Thus, already on the entry level of analysis more emotions and attitudes of journalists (or editorial position) are revealed.

Based on the headline analysis, several major topics or ‘themes’ of the publication can be highlighted.

- (i) *Syrian refugees facing problems (fighting with the system) in Russia.* This set of articles concerns the issues of how Syrians live in Russia; what kind of challenges do they face while processing their refugee status or looking for a job, inability to leave or enter Russia, and prolonged bureaucratic procedures. The newspaper highlights the idea that it is a constant stress and danger for the refugees to remain on the territory of Russia since the country does not provide any help however the risk of being cheated and losing all of the savings is high. The newspaper sharply criticizes the resistance of Russia’s

³¹ Novaya Gazeta # 123. Ticket to Aleppo. Russia does not deport Syrian refugees, it just ignores them. Published 02.11.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/11/02/70392-bilet-v-aleppo>

authorities to help migrants or prevent them from entering the country while the country has an international obligation as a Member of the Council of Europe and Geneva Convention.

- (ii) *The EU – Turkey agreement as a failed effort.* The newspaper dedicated many articles to discuss the details of the agreement between Turkey and the EU. The newspaper highlight that the idea of the agreements is to teach migrant not to cross borders illegally. However, it mainly focuses on its inability to solve the crisis (a temporary solution) alongside with the idea that states failed to fulfill the requirements from both the EU and Turkey side.
- (iii) *Debates around the settlement of the refugee crisis.* This group includes two types of articles. First, valuable opinions towards the refugee crisis. For instance, the newspaper published the interview with George Soros, and an open letter to the people of the world from Syrian artists. Second, journalistic analysis of the situation with refugees in Europe and possible solutions. In most of the publications of this type, the newspaper portrays the crisis as chaos where the countries cannot reach a standard salutation, and run out of ideas on how to handle the crisis. For instance, the article *‘European politicians suggest different solutions for the refugee crisis: the more East – the tougher’* (published in *Novaya Gazeta* on 18.02.2016) discusses the Eastern-European approach to dealing with refugees. “Bulgaria took a moderate position in the resolution of the refugee crisis. Sofia claimed that borders are closed for illegal migrants while refugees should provide strong arguments why they shall be granted an asylum status”³²; “Last year Macedonia almost fell under the pressure of the Balkan traffic. This small Balkan republic was not ready for 100-150 thousands of people cross it monthly”³³; “The plan of the Visegrad group has a simple goal – to stop the Balkan traffic. To archive these countries should build the walls on the borders of Macedonia with Greece and Turkey

³² Novaya Gazeta. European politicians suggest different solutions for the refugee crisis: the more East – the tougher. Published 18.02.2016. URL: www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/02/18/67499-problemu-bezhentsev-prosyat-reshat-bez-provolochek-kolyuchih

³³ Ibid

with Greece”³⁴; “Among the population of all the European Union countries there is rise of anti-migration attitudes and right-wing populism.”³⁵

- (iv) ‘*Dying refugees*’. Some articles are dedicated to the issues of people fleeing from war “Due to the military operations on the border with Aleppo, dozens of thousands of civilians ran away seeking for asylum.”³⁶ Or, refugees risking their lives while crossing the Mediterranean sea “Dead body of the three years old Alan found on the sea shore of Bodrum.”³⁷

Subject analysis. There are a variety of topics representing refugees as victims: ‘victims of war’ (“The boat transporting refugees to Greece sink near Turkey; 18 people died”³⁸), ‘victims of circumstances’ (“Family of refugees from Rakhi has to survive in the half-ruined Siberian village”³⁹), ‘victims of politics’ (“We cannot either kick you out nor help, - Russian authorities claimed”⁴⁰), ‘migration flow’ (“The movement of refugees streamed to the northern part of the country”⁴¹). Among other subjects are ‘crimes’ (“Therefore, four crimes happen Germany during one week committed by refugees and German citizen from Iranian migrant family”⁴²), and ‘walls building’ (“Norway to fence off from Russia <...> Official reason for that is a flow of Middle Eastern migrants”⁴³).

Textual schemata. The newspaper uses a variety of text formats while covering the issues of the refugee crisis. Most of them are long-story formats based on the original journalistic reports. Two times the newspaper published translations from other media sources. For

³⁴ Novaya Gazeta. European politicians suggest different solutions for the refugee crisis: the more East – the tougher. Published 18.02.2016. URL: www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/02/18/67499-problemu-bezhentsev-prosyat-reshat-bez-provolochek-kolyuchih

³⁵ Ibid

³⁶ Novaya Gazeta. Thousands of people run away from Aleppo due to the potential siege of the city. Published 06.02.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/02/06/118364-tysyachi-chelovek-bezhali-iz-aleppo-iz-za-vozmozhnoy-osady-goroda>

³⁷ Novaya Gazeta. The verdict regarding the death of Syrian boy was made in Turkey. Published 04.03.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/04/119370-v-turtsii-vynesli-prigovor-prichastnym-k-gibeli-siriyskogo-malchika>

³⁸ Novaya Gazeta. As a result of shipwreck 18 people died near the coast of Turkey. Published 06.03.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/06/119418-v-rezultate-korablekrusheniya-u-beregov-turtsii-pogibli-18-migrantov>

³⁹ Novaya Gazeta #138. Syrians and emptiness. Published: 09.12.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/12/09/70839-sirytsy-i-pustota>

⁴⁰ Novaya Gazeta #123. Ticket to Aleppo. Published: 02.11.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/11/02/70392-bilet-v-aleppo>

⁴¹ Ibid

⁴² Novaya Gazeta #81. Terror crosses the border. Published 27.07.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/07/27/69378-terror-perehodit-granitsy>

⁴³ Novaya Gazeta #122. Fence is already build. In our minds. Published 31.10.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/10/15/70187-zabor-uzhe-postroen-v-golovah>

instance, the open letter from the Syrian artists ‘*Save Syria*’⁴⁴ to the people of the world, originally published in *The Nation* magazine; and the article written by George Soros ‘*Seven points to save Europe*’⁴⁵ from *Project Syndicate*. The newspaper utilizes the format of a news report - short and concise information pieces that contain 4-5 paragraphs to summarize the information usually from 2-3 different sources. But the most favored story type is a reportage – a news story with an element of the interview - based on the interviews with people. Journalists present the situation or problem from one side (the side of victims) but several sources - interviews with individual or group of individuals, includes journalistic observations. The distinguishing feature of the articles of *Novaya Gazeta* is a high editorial assessment of the situation, problem, or issue. The newspaper articles show a clear editorial position towards the refugee crisis. Journalists present people in a desperate circumstance when they have nothing to lose because they already lost everything they had – job, houses, family members and prospects for brighter future. They show people that were abandoned by the institutions and organizations that are supposed to help them. While doing so, journalists use interview technics, descriptions of people’s emotions, circumstances, and details.

Information courses. *Novaya Gazeta* represents the most diverse range of information sources among all analyzed newspaper. The majority of the information the newspaper gets from the personal interviews with refugees, or witnesses (bus drivers, taxi drivers), etc. Among other information sources are international and domestic NGOs and human right organizations such as Russian based organizations Civic Assistance Committee and Memorial, International human rights organization ‘Save the Children’, Human Rights Watch, Amnesty International, Emergency Response Centre International, Human Rights Watch, ERCI Mapo; media sources such as *NRK*, *CBC News*, *Deutsche Welle*, *The Times*, *Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung*, Turkish newspaper *Zaman*, *ARD*, *The Nation*, *BBC*, *Voice of America*, as well as comments from social media; international and Russian information agencies such as *RIA Novosti*, *Reuters*, *TASS*, Syrian news agency *SANA*, *RBK*, *Dogan*, *Anadolu*; supranational organizations and their representatives such as UN High Commissioner, Doctors without Borders, The UN Refugee Agency, The

⁴⁴ Novaya Gazeta #117. Save Syria. Published 19.10.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/10/19/70223-spasti-siriyu>

⁴⁵ Novaya Gazeta #82. Seven points to save Europe. Published 29.07.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/07/29/69401-sem-punktov-dlya-spaseniya-evropy>

International Organization for Migration; experts from global community such as George Soros; local experts such as Sergey Utkin the head of the strategic studies division of the Russian Academy of Science; politicians – Minister of the foreign affairs of Norway Børge Brende; Consulate General of Finland, Minister of interior of Bavaria Joachim Herrmann, The President of the European Council Donald Tusk, The President of the European Parliament Martin Schulz. There are also some sources that are mentioned vaguely, for instance, ‘representatives of UN declared,’ ‘countries of European Union already claimed,’ ‘Brussels responded,’ ‘European newspapers writes,’ etc. The newspaper does not use Russian official sources of information, giving preferences to the international sources or independent media sources.

Micro level

The analysis shows that *Novaya Gazeta* has several common narratives with *Kommersant*. In the series of articles, refugees are portrayed as (i) ‘victims’ either of war in Syria or negative attitudes towards them. For instance, the article ‘*Russia provokes the rise of migration from Syria*’ (published in *Novaya Gazeta* on 09.02.2016) shows that Russian bombings in Syria might increase the migration flow from Syria to Turkey.⁴⁶ The article ‘*The Times reports on the shooting of Syrian refugees on the border with Turkey*’ (published in *Novaya Gazeta* on 31. 03.2016) informs that Turkish border guards were continuously killing Syrians who tried to cross the border. 16 people were shot dead over a span of four months.⁴⁷ (ii) *Refugees are presented as ‘not welcomed’ in Europe*. For instance, the article ‘*The fence is already built. In minds*’ (published in *Novaya Gazeta* on 31.10.2016) tells how Norway is trying to stop the flow of undocumented migrants from Russia and building the wall on its border.⁴⁸ (iii) ‘*Refugees as a source of crimes*’ is another common narrative. The article ‘*Terror crosses borders. After the ‘bloody week’ Germans are demanding to deport all the migrants*’ (published in *Novaya Gazeta* on 27.07.2016) reports on the outcomes of the series of crimes committed by refugees and

⁴⁶ Novaya Gazeta. The head of European Parliament: Russia provokes the rise of migration from Syria. Published 09.02.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/02/09/118468-glava-evrosoveta-rossiya-sprovotsirovala-usilenie-migratsii-iz-sirii>

⁴⁷ Novaya Gazeta. The Times reports on the shooting of Syrian refugees on the border with Turkey. Published: 31.03.2016 URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/31/120217-the-times-soobschila-o-rasstrele-siriyskih-bezhentsev-na-granitse-s-turtsiei>

⁴⁸ Novaya Gazeta #122. The fence is already built. In minds. Published: 31.10.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/10/15/70187-zabor-uzhe-postroen-v-golovah>

the rise of anti-migration attitudes.⁴⁹ However, this series of narratives that are substantially different from three other analyzed newspapers.

A. Refugees are not welcomed in Russia. Refugees are presented as outside invaders. While Russian armies are fighting on the territory of Syria, the bureaucratic institutions are maintaining obstacles for Syrian refugees seeking asylum in Russia. The newspaper shows Syrians as victims of inhuman bureaucracy in Russia. Those Syrians who escaped to Russia are trying to find a way to move to Europe due to the harsh living conditions and absence of social guarantees. For instance, the article *'Ticket to Aleppo'* (published in *Novaya Gazeta* #123 on 02.11.2016) presents stories of several Syrians trying to escape from Russia to Europe as a result of absence of any social guarantees. However, as soon as they try to cross border, they will be sent back to Syria most likely. "We cannot provide you allowance or accommodation, but if you want to stay – we will not expel you. — That what Mayas has been told in Russia. — We were living here losing money every day. I cannot wait longer. What shall I do? I should go to my kids [to Germany] through Finland and Norway. My relatives from Aleppo escaped to Turkey, but they cannot welcome me. They live in poverty. I cannot go back home either. Armies of different countries are fighting in Aleppo while we are those dying." ⁵⁰

In the series of articles, the newspaper shows Russia as an unreliable international partner abusing international law. The article *'Three Syrian refugees to be deported back to Syria'* (published in *Novaya Gazeta* on 25.02.2016) discusses the case of deportation from the perspective of humanitarian violation. "Based on the international agreements refugees cannot be sent back to a country in the state of war. — Shamil Magomedov, the lawyer of the Memorial, claimed. The Dagestanian emigrational service unofficially said that they feel sorry for Syrian citizens however they cannot change the order received from Moscow."⁵¹ The article *'Doors are closing'* (published in *Novaya Gazeta* #9 on 29.01.2016) discusses the case of Russia keeping its borders closed violating border regimes and partnership agreements between neighboring countries. "Russia refuses to accept refugees from the Middle East who soon to be deported from Norway, despite the fact that they are holders

⁴⁹ Novaya Gazeta #81. Terror crosses borders. After the 'bloody week' Germans are demanding to deport all the migrants. Published 27.07.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/07/27/69378-terror-perehodit-granitsy>

⁵⁰ Novaya Gazeta #123. Ticket to Aleppo: Russia does not deport Syrian refugees; it just ignores them. Published: 02.11.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/11/02/70392-bilet-v-aleppo>

⁵¹ Novaya Gazeta. Three Syrian refugees to be deported back to Syria. Published 25.02.2016. URL: www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/02/25/119065-troih-siriyskih-bezhentsev-deportiruyut-iz-rossii

of the Temporary Residence Permit in Russia.”⁵² While Russia is presented as an aggressive, inhuman actor and unreliable partner trying to seal its border from Syrian refugees fleeing from the war, refugees themselves are shown as victims and silent recipients of the policy suffering from the absence of legal protection.

B. Struggling refugees. The newspaper portrays refugees, lives of whose are not under direct threats and dangers, as struggling to accommodate themselves in a new society. Those Syrian refugees who were granted asylum in Russia are suffering due to lack of any sufficient support, medical or psychological treatment. The article *‘Syrians and emptiness. How does the refugee family from Rake live in a half-destroyed village in Siberia’* (published in *Novaya Gazeta* #138 on 09.12.2016) portrays an everyday life of a Syrian family living in a small village in Siberia, near Tomsk. The article shows how the Syrian family escaped from the war to Siberia struggles to find a job, receive medical treatment, and provide education to their kids: “Living here we don’t know what to expect tomorrow.”⁵³ “Two months our kids Alina and Emad were living in the orphanage, while we were registering and looking for a place to live. It was tough.”⁵⁴ They are also facing xenophobic attitudes: “Once adults called my kid ‘churka’”⁵⁵ (offensive nickname used in the Russian language for people from Caucasus and Central Asia). Another article *‘Syrian refugee is dying from cancer the prison Matrosskaya Tishina’* (published in *Novaya Gazeta* #126 on 11.11.2016) shows how a Syrian refugee – a holder of the Temporary residency of Sweden - being accused of illegal smuggling of rare animals and birds from Russia, cannot find justice and is dying from cancer in prison; however, he is eligible to receive special medical treatment.⁵⁶

C. Refugees as illegal immigrants. Many articles discuss the agreement between Turkey and the European Union. The newspaper criticizes the conditions of this agreement as well as the main idea behind it – not to resolve the migration crisis but to teach refugees to apply for the asylum status following the international law. For instance, in the article

⁵² Novaya Gazeta #9. Doors are closing. Published 29.01.2016. URL:

www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/01/27/67205-dveri-zakryvayutsya

⁵³ Novaya Gazeta #138. Syrians and emptiness. How does the refugee family from Rake live in a half-destroyed village in Siberia. Published 09.12.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/12/09/70839-sirytsy-i-pustota>

⁵⁴ Ibid

⁵⁵ Ibid

⁵⁶ Novaya Gazeta #126. Syrian refugee is dying from cancer the prison Matrosskaya Tishina. Published: 11.11.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/11/11/70492-gde-kogo-za-chto>

‘The head of the European Parliament encouraged migrants to proclaim the asylum status in the EU from the territory of Turkey’ (published in *Novaya Gazeta* on 07.03.2016) depicts how the EU tries to stop boat migrants: “Shultz advised migrants to stop using smuggling services.”⁵⁷

In conclusion, the coverage of the refugee crisis of *Novaya Gazeta* is different from other analyzed newspapers. Firstly, newspapers addressing the crisis through the stories of individuals and families – victims of the war in Syria – focusing on how migration policies affect real people. Even when they escaped the war zone, they are facing struggles in their host countries. Second, the newspaper is focusing on the role of Russia in the refugee crisis. The country is maintaining its military presence in Syria provoking the growth of the migration flow from Syria, at the same time, it strengthens its borders to prevent migrants from coming in. Those refugees who are already in the country receive almost no support. Third, the newspaper draws the attention of its readers to the rise of anti-immigration attitudes in Europe as well as the absence of ideas and solution for the crisis. It shows the struggles of the European Union to elaborate on a cohesive response while countries of Eastern Europe and the Balkans are implementing its own un-coordinated restrictive policies towards migrants. With this focus, Syrian refugees are presented as victims of war, and victims of circumstances, negative social attitudes, and restrictive policies.

⁵⁷ Novaya Gazeta. The head of the European Parliament encouraged migrants to proclaim the asylum status in the EU from the territory of Turkey. Published: 07.03.2016. URL: <https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/07/119443-glava-evroparlamenta-prizval-bezhentsev-zaprashivat-ubezhische-v-es-s-territorii-turtsii>

5.4 Discourse analysis of *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*

During 2016, *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* published 76 articles on the matters of the refugee crisis on a variety of different topics. It represents the most diverse coverage amongst analyzed newspapers with particular attention to the active role of Russia in the resolution of the refugee crisis.

Marco-level

Topical analysis. Most of the topics that the newspaper was reflecting on during the analyzed period are similar to the themes in *Kommersant* and *Vedomosti* newspapers. However, *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* emphasized different aspects of the events and pointed out various issues. Based on the topical analysis, we can put articles into several thematic groups:

(i) *The agreement between the EU and Turkey.* More than 17 articles in the newspaper are dedicated to the discussion of the agreement between Turkey and the EU for transferring refugees from Greece to Turkey. There are several types of narratives. First, the articles that show Turkey as an unreliable international partner, violating human rights and international agreements regarding defending refugees. “Eight Syrian refugees, women and children were shelled by Turkish border guards while trying to enter the territory of Turkey by smuggling rout through mountains in the Western part of Syria.”⁵⁸ “The entire family of Syrian refugees was shot dead trying to cross border.”⁵⁹ Those Syrian refugees who received an asylum status in Turkey are unsafe and suffer from the horrible conditions in the refugee camps and poverty. For instance, the article ‘*The children of Syrian refugees stitch the uniforms on the factories in Turkey*’⁶⁰ shows how Turkish businessman uses cheap child labour to make clothes for terrorists fighting in Syria. Another article ‘*Syrian child was frightened with bombardment ‘for fun’ in Turkey*’⁶¹ shows Turkish society humiliates refugee kids. Another article ‘*Better to stay*

⁵⁸ *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*. Turkish border guards shout Syrian refugees again. Published 20.04.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/04/20/tureckie-pogranichniki-snova-obstreliali-sirijskih-bezhencev.html>

⁵⁹ Ibid

⁶⁰ *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*. The children of Syrian refugees stitch the uniforms on the factories in Turkey. Published: 07.06.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/06/07/smi-deti-sirijskih-bezhencev-shiut-formu-daish-na-fabrikah-v-turcii.html>

⁶¹ *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*. Syrian child was frightened with bombardment ‘for fan’ in Turkey. Published 05.04.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/04/05/v-turcii-rebenka-iz-sirii-radi-shutki-napugali-bombardirovkoj.html>

in the war’ discusses that refugees do not receive necessary medical and social support in Turkey.

“Based on the report of the Amnesty International, more than a dozens of Syrian refugees, transferred to Turkey within the framework of the deal with the EU were tricked. Despite of the promises being released and reunited with their families they remain in the camp. In the anonymous interviews they have confessed: It is better to go back to the war zone in Syria then stay here.”⁶²

Second, a set of articles elaborate on the criticism of the EU reaching agreements with such unreliable partners as Turkey. These reports show that for the EU, it is more important to solve its own, internal, problems then defend human rights of refugees. For instance, the article ‘*Showing off support for migrants*’ (published in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* on 24.04.2016) reports in the visit of Angela Merkel and Donald Tusk to the refugee camp in Turkey. “European guests saw a glamor picture which fits the purpose of the tour – to promote the deal between Ankara and Brussels.”⁶³ “Tusk called Turkey as the best example of how countries shall treat refugees.”⁶⁴ Article states that Angela Merkel and Donald Tusk were tricked with a “beautiful picture”, however, it is “dangerously far from being real.”⁶⁵ Narratives of this group of articles aim at showing how cynical the agreement between Ankara and Brussels is. And, the role of the EU as a global defender of human rights is overestimated. The EU is presented as a local political player solving its internal social and economic problems the best way possible, not concerning too much of the interests of the migrants.

(ii) *The Russia’s military and humanitarian involvement in Syria and its consequences for the refugee crisis*. These types of narratives aim at defending Russian military involvement in Syria as well as it greater role of helping refugees. The article ‘*Thank to the Russian Federation Syrian starting to return home*’ (published in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* on 17.01.2016) states that “ The success of the Russia’s military operation fighting ISIS

⁶² Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Better to stay in the war. Published 17.05.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/05/17/turciiu-ulichili-v-nedobrosovestnom-obrashchenii-s-bezhencami.html>

⁶³ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Showing off support for migrants. Published: 24.04.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/04/24/v-turcii-kancleru-frg-pokazali-reklamnyj-lager-dlia-bezhencev.html>

⁶⁴ Ibid

⁶⁵ Ibid

led to some Syrian refugees being able to return home.”⁶⁶ Russia is always sending humanitarian aid to the people in Syria which discussed in several articles, such as *‘Refugees in Aleppo received around 15 tons of goods’*⁶⁷; *‘Russian military sent two tons of humanitarian aid to the residents of Hama province.’*⁶⁸ Several analytical articles were dedicated specifically to argue against European criticism towards Russia. Many European leaders, including Angela Merkel, accused Russia of increasing the refugee flow due to its bombings in Syria. There were even proposals from several European countries, including the UK, to implement new sanctions against Russia due to its contribution to escalation of the refugee crisis. The *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* prepared the response, calling European partners as “surprisingly blind” and quoting the representative of the Ministry of Defense: “Thank to the very accurate actions of the Syrian army and Russia’s involvement the situation in Aleppo was drastically changed. In fact, half of the territory occupied by the terrorists was completely freed. What is more important, 80 thousand Syrians, including thousands of children, received humanitarian aid for the first time.”⁶⁹ Thus, the goal of the newspaper is to defend Russia’s military involvement in Syria and its decisive role in the resolution of the humanitarian crisis and, at the same time to demonstrate its readers how the European political leaders try to slender Russia once again. “The prime minister of Bulgaria came up with a different answer. Europeans are not the ones who to blame for the refugee crisis, he confident. As it recently became fashionable, he decided to blame Russia once again.”⁷⁰

(iii) *Adverse consequences of accepting refugees.* The aims of this type of narratives is to elaborate on social insecurity that refugees bring with them to the European countries. The newspaper never discusses the unwillingness to accept refugees by Russia, however, shows the negative consequences for European countries taking them. Migrants bring terrorism threats and social insecurity: “The massive fighting between migrants happened

⁶⁶ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Thank to the Russian Federation Syrian starting to return home. Published 17.01.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/01/17/bezentsy-site-anons.html>

⁶⁷ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Refugees in Aleppo received around 15 tons of goods Published 29.09.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/09/29/v-aleppo-bezhencam-peredali-poriadka-15-tonny-produktov.html>

⁶⁸ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Russian military sent two tons of humanitarian aid to the residents of Hama province. Published 28.07.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/07/28/rossijskie-voennye-dostavili-v-hamu-dve-tonny-gumanitarnoj-pomoshchi.html>

⁶⁹ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Russia declined ‘incredible losses among residents of Aleppo. Published 29.11.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/11/29/rossiia-oprovergla-neveroiatnye-poteri-sredi-zhitelej-aleppo.html>

⁷⁰ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Prime Minister of Bulgaria accused the EU and Russia in the refugee crisis. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/10/06/premer-bolgarii-obvinil-v-evropejskom-migracionnom-krizise-ssha-i-rf.html>

nearby the capital of Bulgaria.”⁷¹ The analytical article ‘*Hands off from Germany*’ (published in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* on 25.05.2016) shows the series of crimes committed by the refugees that affected the Russian-speaking community in Germany. Russian businesspeople and citizens became victims of robbery, break-ins, and fights perpetrated by migrants. “Before the New Year a group of refugees came into the Russian store. They started ripping packages with sweets putting candies into their pockets. When the owner of the warehouse came, they hit him with the knife.”⁷² Article states that German media avoid giving publicity to the crimes committed by refugees. “The events in Koln break through the information blockade. Right now, many cases of robbery and rapes started to appear on the media and internet.”⁷³ The analysis of the information sources shows that this article is predominantly based on gossip and people’s talking about stories that they heard or allegedly happen to them. The journalist does not provide any factual analysis, and facts from reliable sources. The journalists present these stories as a real crimes committed by Syrian refugees, however, there is no evidence of that. “The wildest incident happened in the Baptist community. They accommodated several refugees, provided food and drinks for them. Once they left for prayer and left them with a 13 years old girl alone. When they came back, they found her brutally raped.”⁷⁴ The article is full of ‘horror’ stories, presenting the Russian-speaking community in Germany as victims of a policy of ‘open doors’ provided by Angela Merkel.

Subject analysis. Based on the subject analysis we can distinguish several groups: (a) A significant number of articles show refugees as ‘dying’, ‘suffering’, ‘struggling’ from war in Syria, harsh conditions in the refugee camps, sea disasters, etc. (b) Another group of articles can be combined based on the common subjects of ‘crimes’, ‘rapes’, and ‘terrorism’, ‘illegal border crossers’. Refugees are those who bring instability and insecurity to Europe. (c) There are also number of subjects that are not directly related to narratives about refugees but to other actors involved in the refugee crisis: ‘Canada is open for the refugees’, ‘Russia is a defender of the refugees’, ‘Incapability of Europe’ with regard to solving the refugee crisis, ‘Turkey as unreliable partner’.

⁷¹ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. In Sofia, three people were injured during the mass fight of migrants. Published 25.05.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/05/25/v-sofii-tri-cheloveka-postradali-v-hode-massovoj-draki-migrantov.html>

⁷² Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Hands off from Germany. Published 25.05.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/05/25/v-sofii-tri-cheloveka-postradali-v-hode-massovoj-draki-migrantov.html>

⁷³ Ibid

⁷⁴ Ibid

Textual schemata. There are three types of the text structures that journalists of *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* predominantly use when discussing the refugee crisis. (a) A short information articles, consisting of 2-3 paragraphs. These reports do not contain any original information and are based on other information sources such as information agencies, media sources. They provide necessary information without any analysis of the events. (b) A longer information pieces, consisting of 8-10 paragraphs that aim at informing readers about the event as well as providing details, background, quotes of speakers, and commentary. Both types of texts represent balanced and concise articles, reflecting on the same breaking news and important events as other analyzed newspapers. However, some of the information articles present only one opinion – the position of Russia’s political elite, and official positions. Some of them are constructed in a defensive manner – criticizing Europe, defending Russia’s actions. The most unusual types of articles is (c) analytical articles written by journalists, never experts or influential figures. The analytical articles aim at giving a substantial explanation of the sets of the events, putting them into historical context and projecting the future. These articles discuss: a series of crimes committed by migrants in Germany; why do the refugees flee to Europe instead of Muslim countries, etc. These articles have several common characteristics: journalists utilize strong language with emotional and negative connotations when talking about refugees fleeing to Europe; absence of proper referencing to the sources (or sources remain unknown); in some occasions, journalists present opinions (or even gossip, people’s talks) as facts; journalist do not refer to external experts when analyzing events, on the contrary they interpret the events freely, providing their own interpretation. Articles of this type aim at forming and influencing the public opinion; they utilize strong negative language when prescribing refugees as well as presenting European countries and the UN as incapable of handling the refugee crisis and unable to come up with proper solutions.

Information sources. Most of the articles are either short or extended news pieces where the newspaper refers to the variety of the international and Russia media sources. Among them (i) media sources: *Daily Mail*, *The Times*, *The Guardian*; German newspapers *Süddeutsche Zeitung*, *Die Welt*, *Spiegel*, *Mitteldeutsche Zeitung*, *Bild*; Focus Online; Greek television ERT, Greek newspaper *Καθημερινή*, Turkish newspaper *Hurriyet*, Al Jazeera; Sky News Arabia; Daily Star; *Contra Magazine*; Russia Today. (ii)

Information agencies - TASS; Interfax; Reuters; (iii) International organizations – the United Nations, Amnesty International; OSCE. The newspaper frequently quotes European political leaders such as General Chancellor of Germany - Angela Merkel, the President of the European Council - Donald Tusk, the President of the United States - Donald Trump, the Prime-Minister of Greece - Alexis Tsipras; the President of the Czech Republic - Miloš Zeman, European Commissioner for European Neighbourhood Policy and Enlargement Negotiations - Johannes Hahn, the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Turkey — Mevlüt Çavuşoğlu. As an official newspaper of the Russian Government, it refers quite often to the official information sources of Russia such as Russia's Ministry of Defense; the Ministry of Internal Affairs, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs; the Prime Minister of Russia – Dmitry Medvedev, the press-secretary of Russia's President – Dmitry Peskov. Some of the information sources remain unknown.

Micro-level

Several narratives were the most common among all analyzed newspapers, which can also be found in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*.

A. Refugees as a source of crimes and terrorism. The Syrian refugees are shown as potentially dangerous for the societal security and stability. For instance, the article '*Refugees may repeat the terrorism attack of 09/11*' (published in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* on 16.05.2016) quotes the Presidential candidate Donald Trump, who is saying: "A lot of bad things will happen. There will be attacks that you cannot believe right now. Those who arrive into our country right now will commit committed crimes."⁷⁵

B. Refugees are not welcomed in Europe. Voices from Eastern and Central Europe raise their resistance and unwillingness to accept refugees. For instance, the news article '*Milos Zeman makes a stand against relocating Muslim refugees in the Czech Republic*' (published in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* on 02.08.2016) demonstrates the anti-migration attitudes on top of the high level of the European political elite: "Accepting migrants we create a ground for brutal attacks on the territory of the Czech Republic. Our country

⁷⁵ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Trump: Refugees may repeat the terrorism attack of 09/11. Published: 16.05.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/05/16/tramp-bezhency-mogut-povtorit-terakty-11-sentiabria.html>

cannot take the risk of the terrorist attacks that happened in France and Germany.”⁷⁶

C. Refugees as illegal immigrants. Several articles show that the refugees come to Europe illegally on boats. These processes are hard to stop or control. For instance, the article *‘The oldest refugee in the world became 155 years old Syrian woman’* (published in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* on 15.02.2016) tells the story of a family that choose to immigrate by the illegal rout. “Ahmed paid to smugglers to transfer his pregnant wife, his four kids, himself and an old lady in a will chair, a friend of their family, to Turkey by the dangerous sea route.”⁷⁷

D. Refugees as victims. This narrative relates the refugees as victims of political, social or other causes. People are presented as dying, displaced and losing their hopes. For instance, the article *‘The refugee camp on the Isle of Lesbos burn down as a result of a severe fire’*⁷⁸ and the article *‘Two refugee boats sink near the shore of Turkey. 22 were found dead’* discuss the refugees as victims of circumstances that they cannot change.⁷⁹

E. Refugees are abusers of the international law. A significant number of articles contains narrative of refugees abusing international law, or using the reason of civil war in Syria for seeking economic benefits in Europe. One of the illustrative examples of it is the analytical article *‘Who and why guide the refugee flows in Europe.’* (published in *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* on 17.01.2016) The main idea of this piece is to show how the refugees are abusing the policies of the European Union, which tears Europe apart, creates tensions and makes the European Union weaker. “A significant number of states of the Old World is not willing to pay for the policy of open doors, conducted by Angela Merkel.”⁸⁰ The language this articles is strongly negative and contains exaggerations, or even misreporting. For instance, “The Austrian chancellor Werner Faymann declared on

⁷⁶ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Milos Zeman makes a stand against relocating Muslim refugees in the Czech Republic. Published: 02.08.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/08/02/milosh-zeman-vystupil-protiv-razmeshcheniia-bezhencev-musulman-v-chehii.html>

⁷⁷ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. The oldest refugee in the world became 155 years old Syrian woman. Published 15.10.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/10/15/samoj-pozhiloi-bezhenkoj-v-mire-stala-115-letniaia-zhitelnica-sirii.html>

⁷⁸ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. The refugee camp on the Isle of Lesbos burn down as a result of a severe fire. Published 20.09.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/09/20/na-grechskom-ostrove-lesbos-polnostiu-vygorel-lager-dlia-bezhencev.html>

⁷⁹ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Two refugee boats sink near the shore of Turkey. 22 were found dead. Published 08.07.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/02/08/dve-lodki-s-bezhencami-zatonuli-u-beregov-turcii-pogibli-33-cheloveka.html>

⁸⁰ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Who and why guide the refugee flows in Europe. Published 17.01.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/01/17/avstria-site.html>

leaving the Schengen zone.”⁸¹ However, the chancellor just said: “We will tighten the control of our border and deport all the refugees who have no right to stay on our territory.”⁸² The newspaper states that people, fleeing to Europe, are just pretending to be poor, however, they were able to pay up to 10 000 crowns to stay in Denmark. “The authorities of the Denmark were harshly criticized when they made an attempt to confiscate the amount exceeded 10000 crowns, including gold, watches, and jewelry from the incoming refugees to cover their stay in the country.”⁸³ The newspaper assumes as these who are coming to Europe are not poor, as they are willing to pay that much. Thus, Europe should strengthen their borders in front of ‘liars,’ who have no rights to seek asylum in the EU. The narrative of the article is based on the idea that refugees are a threat for Europe as they are abusing the social welfare system. “Most of the migrants are not willing to integrate into the European society and look for legal income, counting on the welfare benefits that exist in different developed countries of the European Union.”⁸⁴ The journalist asks a rhetorical question: ‘Why do they run to Europe?’ instead of instead of neighboring countries which are similar to their cultures. “They aim at settling in the European countries that differ in their mentality, values, cultural norms, and language, in the meantime, there are a number of Muslim states, where new settlers will not have these problems.”⁸⁵ This argument is used as affirmation that migrants are looking for economic benefits rather than escaping from the war, as well as the reassurance that smugglers make a considerable profit transporting migrants just in one way – to Europe. According to the journalists, there is no doubt that the refugees, poorly educated and coming from traditional societies, will not be successfully assimilated in Europe and represent a social threat, by committing crimes and acts of terrorism.

In conclusion, compared to other analyzed newspapers, *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* utilizes more Russian official sources when discussing the refugee crisis. Therefore it takes a significant part in constructing the Russian official discourse of the refugee crisis, which mostly reflects the idea of border protection and justifying Russia’s actions in Syria.

⁸¹ Rossiyskaya Gazeta. Who and why guide the refugee flows in Europe. Published 17.01.2016. URL: <https://rg.ru/2016/01/17/avstria-site.html>

⁸² Ibid

⁸³ Ibid

⁸⁴ Ibid

⁸⁵ Ibid

5.5 Discussion

The analysis of four major quality broadsheet newspapers of Russia displays the differences and similarities between the media discourse on the refugee crisis. The interdisciplinary approach of the critical discourse analysis designed based on the researches of Teun A. Van Dijk allowed us to analyse the media discourse from multiple perspectives, including analysis of information sources, textual structures, topics and subject of analysis, and linguistic analysis aimed at discovering major narratives on refugees.

Representations of the refugees in the media: dominant frames

Frames	<i>Kommersant</i>	<i>Vedomosti</i>	<i>Novaya Gazeta</i>	<i>Rossiyskaya Gazeta</i>
Refugees are a source of crimes and terrorism	X		X	X
Migrants are a threat to the social stability of political system of the EU	X			
Refugees are not welcomed in Russia	X		X	
Refugees as victims	X	X	X	X
Refugees are not welcomed in Europe		X	X	X
Helping refugees		X		
Struggling refugees			X	
Refugees as illegal immigrants			X	X
Refugees are abusers of the international law				X

Within the discourses of four analysed newspapers, there are seven most common frames of refugees that were highlighted during the analysis. These frames formulate the discourse and were collected based on their repetition in the articles and strong emotional connotation of some of them.

Refugees as a source of crimes and terrorism. One of the common narratives presents refugees as a source of crimes and acts of terrorism. All four analysed newspapers reported on the series of crimes committed by refugees in Germany in the summer 2016 as central events in the refugee crisis, after which the supportive attitudes towards them in the society has changed. Some articles also show that the refugees are being perceived as criminals even when they did not commit crimes, remaining actors that are easy to be blamed.

Refugees as a threat for social stability and political security. One of the most common narratives is presenting the refugees as a potential threat for economy, and social security

of European countries. They abuse social welfare and spark the rise of xenophobia in Europe as well as challenging the stability of the European political system. Their presence in the country is often associated with the threat of terrorism, Islamic extremism, and the rise of crime. In some articles, especially those touching upon Central and Eastern European countries, they are also presented as a threat for cultural identity and Christianity.

Refugees are not welcomed in Russia (unwanted invaders). A quite large number of articles describes the unwillingness to accept and accommodate migrants, especially when discussing the countries of Central and Eastern Europe, the Balkans, and Russia. Refugees remain ‘unwanted’ for multiple reasons: as a threat for social security, due to cultural and religious reasons, due to economic inability to accommodate new members of the society, and many others.

Refugees as victims. Many articles present refugees as victims of civil war in Syria, surviving in a harsh condition in the refugee camps. They are dying in large numbers trying to escape a war zone and dangerously fleeing to Europe on boats. They are also victims of anti-emigration attitudes within the societies of many European countries, or brutal policies (many articles are discussing the actions of Turkey sending refugees back to Syria or shooting them at the border).

Refugees are not welcomed in Europe. This narrative is reflected in a multiple articles covering the anti-refugee attitudes and cases of xenophobia in Europe. Refugees are presented as a problem from the perspectives of cultural security, culture, and religion. One of the common narratives is anti-immigration policies and restrictions in the countries of Eastern Europe, and the Balkans.

Helping refugees. This unpopular narrative was primarily formulated by the representatives of supranational institutional and international organizations, such as the UN, the Red Cross, Amnesty International, and Doctors Without Borders through interviews, statements, and comments in the media. The central idea of this narrative is to unite and strengthen the supportive attitude as the highest humanistic idea, which is central for European normative power.

Struggling refugees. Within this frame, refugees are portrayed as having troubles accommodating themselves in the new societies, having social, economic, or medical problems while living in asylum. This frame is similar to the representation of the refugees as victims. However, the last one presents refugees as dying or surviving in dangerous conditions, or life threatening circumstances.

Refugees as illegal immigrants. A quite large number of articles, especially short information pieces, show refugees as illegal border crossers; those who do not follow the international border crossing or asylum seeking legislation. Articles reflecting on those fleeing to Europe on boats in large numbers; being stopped on the borders; dying while trying to reach the territories of European states. As a consequence of illegal immigration, the crisis acquired uncontrolled, chaotic nature.

Refugees as abusers of the international law. This narrative was diligently reproduced by the Governmentally owned *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*. Refugees, meaning those who flee to Europe, are using the reason of civil war in Syria to seek economic benefits in European countries. They are presented as ‘liars’ and ‘manipulators’ who should not be tolerated. Meanwhile, the ‘true’ refugees (real victims of the war) are those who remain in the refugee camps on the territory of Syria and are looking for asylum in the neighbouring Muslim countries with similar cultural and religious traditions.

The analysis shows a high level of similarities within the dominant frames in Russian and European newspapers. Seven dominant frames of European newspapers, that were highlighted in the second chapter of this thesis can be found in the Russian analysed newspapers with several exceptions. For instance, the frame formulated as *The leading role of the West in solving the crisis* can be found in *Kommersant* and *Novaya Gazeta*, however, it is missing from the discourse of *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*. On the contrary, the West, or the European Union, shows as lacking political will and capacities to resolve the refugee crisis. The frame *Positive effect of migration* equally rarely appears in European and Russian newspapers. This idea almost entirely absents from the discourse of *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*. The frame *Refugees as abusers of the international law*, introduced by *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* does not exist or not significant for the discourse of the European newspapers. Thus, these observations lead to the assumption that the refugee discourse

produced by the Russian quality newspapers follow along the lines of European media discourses. Even though there are certain differences in place, the framing patterns shows the great deal of similarity.

Differences and similarities within the discourse

There are eight features in narrative patterns that shows the similarities within the discourses of four analysed newspapers.

The use of foreign media as an information source. All selected newspapers refer to the international media, predominantly European newspapers, TV and radio broadcasters, and information agencies, as valid information sources. All four newspapers use direct quotations, translations of pieces or full articles in their discourse. Based on this common pattern, we may assume that the European media narratives remain valid and important to understand when it comes to the analysis of the Russian media discourse, as they influence and formulate the discourse. And, at the same time, common features and narratives of the European media discourse appear in the Russian media as well.

In general, issues dedicated to the refugee crisis have not been a central interest for the newspapers. Considering a daily (or, 3 times a week in case of *Vedomosti*) circulation of each newspaper, a total 148 number of articles can be considered as a low number, meaning the topic of the refugee crisis was not prominent for the newspapers. Another evidence of this is the popularity of short news formats when discussing the refugee crisis. Short news pieces aim at informing the audience about events, without providing analysis, commentary or substantial background.

A domination of negative representations of the refugees. An overwhelming majority of the articles in four newspapers contains negative narratives on refugees. The refugees are presents as a ‘mass’, ‘flow’, ‘increasing number’ of people fleeing to Europe and bringing problems and security threats. They are almost never discussed from the perspective of positive contributions to European societies. There is a clear lack of positive stories of successful integration.

The refugee crisis is almost exclusively a European concern. Even though, Russia pursues military operations in Syria, which may increase the number of the refugees fleeing from the war. Russia is presented as an external actor towards the crisis. All four newspapers present the refugee crisis as a global problem, that significantly affects the European Union first. However, Russia is either presented as not willing to play an any role in the resolution of the crisis, or as keeping its borders tight in front of refugees, making the asylum seeking procedures extremely difficult for migrants. The issues regarding the asylum policies of Russia either not presented in newspapers (*Vedomosti*) or substantially criticized (*Novaya Gazeta*).

Refugees are not welcomed in Russia. Russia is presented as an unsafe country for the refugees. The journalistic stories describe that refugees have problems applying for asylum, do not receive basic legal, economic, social, or medical support. Russian bureaucracy attempts to implement any possible measures for not letting refugees in.

Incapability of the European Union to reach the agreements regarding the refugee crisis. All four newspapers present internal debates between the EU member states in terms of how the crisis should be dealt with. The lack of coherent response to the crisis led to the social and political debates on the level of individual member states as well as the European Union as a whole. All newspapers draw attention to the rise of anti-immigration attitudes in Europe as well as the absence of ideas and solution for the crisis. It shows struggles of the European Union to elaborate on a common solution while countries of the Eastern Europe and Balkans are implementing their own un-coordinated restrictive policies towards migrants.

Interchangeable use of terms 'migrant' and 'refugee'. The analysed newspapers do not draw a distinction line between 'refugees' and 'migrants'. Journalists utilize these terms interchangeably as synonyms. Interestingly, the Russian language is missing the term 'asylum seeker', thus it has not been in use.

Refugees are passive recipients of policies. An overwhelming number of articles present refugees as silent actors or recipients of actions, referring to them as a 'number' or 'mass' of people instead of individuals. They are not given an opportunity to say or raise their voices in cases of the actions that are taken over them.

Repetition of subjects. There is a common set of subjects that can be found in all analysed newspapers, among them: ‘crimes,’ ‘Islamic terrorism,’ ‘migrant attacks,’ ‘migrant flows,’ ‘border control,’ ‘escaping from war’ and ‘solidarity crisis.’

Despite multiple similarities, each of the analysed newspapers dealt with the refugee crisis issues differently which reflects in the frequency of publications, utilization of the information sources, and emphasis on different ideas within the narratives.

Kommersant. The newspaper reflects on the higher level of the refugee debate. In the spotlight, the political debate within European politics regarding the appropriate solution and resolution mechanisms for the crisis. The newspaper draws special attention to how the refugee crisis affects the European political system and spark the internal political debate within the member states. The newspaper places Germany in the centre of the refugee discourse. On the one hand, the country is nearly the only one welcoming refugees, on the other hand, this creates new challenges for political system of the country. In terms of the information sources, the newspaper predominantly utilizes reliable international sources, affiliated with European politics. It reflects in the topics: most of them present the refugee crisis as a European problem. When it comes to the expert evaluation or commentary, the newspaper refers to the Russia-based experts linked to the different branches of Russian academy of science. The newspaper discusses refugees and crisis as a phenomenon, it almost never gives a voice to the real people or victims. The overall newspaper’s narrative of the refugees is negative. Refugees are portrayed as problematic and unwanted in Europe and Russia; they create problems, social tensions, commit crimes and increase insecurity.

Vedomosti. The newspaper published the lowest number of articles regarding the refugee crisis issues amongst four analysed publications. It is a clear indication of the fact that the refugee crisis issues did not show the priority for the attention of *Vedomosti*. Another supportive argument is that, the majority of articles in the newspaper are short news pieces with the aim to quickly inform the audience about the breaking news and predominantly negative events, such as instances of crimes, rapes, and death involving refugees. Therefore, the dominant narrative of the refugees in the newspapers is negative. There are several attempts to analyse the crisis from economic and business perspectives,

however, these articles are small in numbers. *Vedomosti* almost does not make an attempt to conduct a journalistic analysis of the migration crisis; it does not represent different sides of the conflict, principal actors, decision makers, victims of the crisis. There is simply no discussions around European policy towards refugees, as well the role of Russia is not presented. Thus, the coverage of the refugee crisis of the newspaper is not coherent or systematic.

Novaya Gazeta. The refugee discourse of *Novaya Gazeta* is substantially different from other analysed newspapers. The newspaper made a clear effort to represent the voices of refugees and victims of war in Syria. It also predominantly focuses on Russia's asylum policies and response to the crisis. In the interviews with Syrian refugees in Russia, journalists show what kind of obstacles, bureaucratic procedures, economic and social problems asylum seekers in Russia should overcome. Refugees are not safe and secure in Russia, most of them are trying to escape to Europe where they have economic and social benefits. Those who remain in Russia are suffering from the outcomes of anti-immigration policies, social attitudes and bureaucratic resistance of the country. *Novaya Gazeta* is the only newspaper, amidst analysed publications, that frequently refers to the NGOs and non-political actors, that are helping accommodate migrants in Russia, as an information sources and for the expert opinions for the investigative and analytical journalistic pieces. Therefore, the major narratives of the refugee discourse of the newspaper represent migrants fleeing from the war as victims, people in need, those who are seeking for help and support.

Rossiyskaya Gazeta. The newspaper published an almost equal number of articles as the three other analysed publications all together, which indicates that the issues of the refugee crisis were of utmost importance to the newspaper in 2016. *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* is one of the instruments for formulating the Russia's official position regarding the war in Syria and the refugee crisis, through publication of statements, reports or comments of the political leaders of the country on matters of the refugee crisis. The narratives of the newspaper can be divided in two groups. First, the articles that reflects on the same types of events as other newspapers. These articles are short news pieces, covering breaking news or important events regarding the refugee crisis, utilizing reliable Russian or international information sources. The articles on the same topics can be found elsewhere

in the media. Second, critical assessment of the refugee crisis. These articles provide a strongly negative journalistic position on the matters, presenting refugees fleeing to Europe as abusers of international law, and those who seek for economic benefits. Journalists interpret facts freely, picking those which support the position presented in the articles. In some cases, comments or gossip are presented as facts, in other cases sources of information are not disclosed. The textual analysis shows that an unprofessional reader may not notice these important nuances, as the language that journalists utilizes is convincing and self-consistent. Refugees, in the newspaper's narrative, are those who commit crimes and acts on terrorism, rise insecurity and destabilize European politics. Thus, Russia should tighten its border, not letting fleeing people enter the country and escalate societal security problems as they do in Europe.

The conducted analysis revealed the absence of certain topics and, as a consequence, certain narratives in the discourse on the refugee crisis in four Russian national quality daily newspapers. First, there is a clear lack of positive stories. The newspapers almost never discuss the examples of the successful assimilation of refugees into European societies. Second, there is an absence of the idea of benefiting from accepting refugees. The notion that refugees will contribute to the economy and cultural diversity of the host countries, or can be successfully integrated never seem to appear in the analysed publications.

Therefore, the results of the analysis show that the differences in framing the refugee crisis in four newspapers appear on different levels of discourse: from explanations of the reasons to a general representation of the situation.

The analysis is conducted based on the assumption that that the closer a newspaper's affiliation appears to governmental structures, the more the narrative reflects the ownership structures; while when the media appears further from the governmental structures the explanatory power of ownership declines, and the relative power of editorial position and specialization increases. We can observe the importance of ownership only in case of state-owned newspaper (*Rossiyskaya Gazeta*). The newspaper makes a clear effort to represent Russia's state narrative through interviews, statements and declarations of official authorities and high representatives of the country. Thus, the newspaper takes

part in formulating the Russian state position. However, we cannot claim that the factor of ownership can be observed through the discourse of independent (or, relatively independent) newspapers. The influence may be subtler, if there is any, and to reveal it we shall have to go beyond pure discourse analysis (however, this was taken into consideration as a limitation). During the analysis we observed many similarities between state-owned and privately owned newspapers. For instance, all of the newspapers depict the refugee crisis as external towards Russia, or raise great concerns regarding the possibilities of reaching a common solution for the crisis within Europe. The state-owned and private publications have similar framing patterns, and the closeness of narratives was also noted. Nonetheless, the explanations behind the frames are different. These differences within the narratives of independent newspapers can be explained by the editorial position (including political position of the newspaper, audience and orientation). For instance, in the case of *Kommersant*, the newspaper mainly discusses the impact of the refugee crisis on the European politic as the one of the major specialized focuses of the newspaper is to give a deep and comprehensive analysis of European political agendas. *Vedomosti* does not provide any coherent coverage of the refugees, since the main focus of the outlet is the analysis of Russian business, while the refugee crisis does not match this area. *Novaya Gazeta* historically focuses more on socio-economic analysis and investigative journalism, thus it provides substantial journalistic analysis representing real stories of refugees. In case of state-owned *Rossiyskaya Gazeta*, there is a clear focus on representing of Russia's state narrative – defending the position of Russia. All in all, privately-owned and state-owned newspapers show significant similarities (frames) and differences (reasons and explanations behind frames) of narratives.

Conclusion

This Thesis addresses the issues of the representation of the refugee crisis in the Russian quality media. In the light of the ongoing debate regarding the reasons and consequences of the current refugee crisis in the political discourse in the European Union and Russia, the topic of the analysis is highly relevant. Whereas media plays a significant role in formulating the agenda for social and political debate, it also shapes public opinion towards the matter.

Four nation-wide quality daily newspapers – *Kommersant*, *Vedomosti*, *Novaya Gazeta*, and *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* - occupy an important place in the country's media system, as their main focus is in the areas of the foreign policy of Russia, performance of state government, foreign affairs, and broader domestic agendas, which is in the concern of the whole country and some particular regions. The newspapers influence the opinions of social, political, and business elite of the country, and play the role of reliable sources of information, appropriate to use in the decision-making.

The first and second chapters of this thesis give the necessary background and context for the research. The first chapter briefly discusses the key characteristics of the Russian media system. It presents the challenges of the development process: from gaining media freedom in the 1990s to further media concentration and the strengthening of state control over media in 2000s. The contemporary Russian media system is best described as having two-tiers: on one hand, a strong media concentration and financial dependence on the governmental bodies; and on the other hand, existence of free, or relatively free, however marginalized, media sources on the different levels of media system. The historical context and characteristics of Russia's media system facilitated the better understanding of the quality media as an essential piece of the national media system, gives an idea regarding the size and the scope of the media landscape of Russia as such. The second chapter, aimed at describing the refugee narratives in the European newspapers. This is essential for understanding the main idea, frames and narrative of the refugee discourse. The analysis showed that Russian newspapers refer to different types of European media as information sources while covering topics of the refugee crisis. Thus, the existing frames and narratives may be the key to understand refugee narratives in the Russian newspapers.

The ultimate goal of this research was to reveal the main narratives and frames of the refugees and the refugee crisis in the Russian quality papers, while answering the main research question: How do Russian quality newspapers portray the current refugee crisis?

In order to answer the main research question, the method of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) of media text was applied. The analytical frame of this research was designed based on the Teun A. van Dijk's earlier works on discourse. He remains one of the central scholars, when it comes to studying media discourse on the refugees and other minorities. He argues that the discourse analysis approach is especially useful when it comes to studying the representation of minorities in the media. He claims that ethnic prejudice is socially reproduced through discourse, therefore, in order to understand social communication of ethnic attitudes, we should examine the structure of discourses in details. One of the major channels reproducing them is print media. Teun A. van Dijk greatly contributed to developing a comprehensive interdisciplinary methodological approach of discourse analysis, which borrows substantially from discourse linguistics, psychology, conversational analysis, ethnography of speaking, sociolinguistics, and microsociology.

The empirical material of the analysis was the content of four Russian leading quality newspapers with country-wide distribution over a span of 2016, which comprises of 148 articles in total. The analysis revealed seven of the most common framing patterns of refugees: 'refugees as a threat,' 'refugees as victims,' 'people in need,' 'refugees as unwanted invaders,' 'illegal migrants,' 'abusers of international law.' This shows the similarities to the framing patterns of the European media: all these frames can be found in European newspapers, as it is described in the second chapter.

The analysis is based on the hypothesis assuming that the closer a newspaper's affiliation appears to governmental structures, the more the narrative reflects the ownership structures; while when the media appears further from the governmental structures the explanatory power of ownership declines, and the relative power of editorial position and specialization increases. The conducted analysis shows that the ownership matters only in case of governmentally-owned newspaper. However, when it comes to the independent outlets, such factors as specialization, and editorial position may be explanatory factors discussing the differences within narratives. The conducted analysis reveals differences

and similarities in the refugee discourse between relatively independent and governmentally owned newspapers. All four newspapers portray the refugee crisis as extremely dangerous for political and social stability of European Union and Russia; refugees are mostly discussed from the negative perspectives; all newspapers depict the refugee crisis as a European problem and an external issue for Russia. However, the differences among the narratives occur on the explanatory level: newspapers raise the attention to the different details and nuances of the crisis. While *Novaya Gazeta* depicts refugees as those who are saving their lives fleeing from the war in Syria, *Rossiyskaya Gazeta* makes a clear account of those seeking economic benefits in Europe using the war as an excuse to improve their living standards.

This research suffers from certain limitations which are the consequences of the research design. First, this study touches upon the discourse of the Russian quality newspapers, so the outcomes cannot be extended to other types of media (for example, specialized newspapers or for general audience) and information channels (television, information agencies). Second, based on the design of the analytical frame, this research aimed to examine the discursive frames to depict refugees. It does not provide a substantial linguistic analysis, or analysis of images and ideologies, as the main scope of the research is the distinguishing of dominant frames and a basic comparison of the narratives of four newspapers. Third, as per the hypothesis, the idea to prove a direct impact of the ownership, readership or specialization to editorial content of newspaper seems unrealistic. To do so, we need to examine the internal corporate documents regulating the relationship between ownership and newsroom, or how newspaper responds on the readership inquires. However, the idea was reduced to the verification whether the ownership structures, editorial position, and specialization of the media can be seen through discourse generated by the media and the potential to use them as an explanatory factor.

In light of the outcomes of this thesis, further research can focus on the examination of similarities and differences in refugee discourses of different types of Russian media; what kind of visual and linguistic technics and approaches have been utilized in order to create certain framing patterns. Further research may also be directed at the exploration of impact of the media discourse of refugee crisis on the audience.

Bibliography

1. Anckar, C. (2008). On the applicability of the most similar systems design and the most different systems design in comparative research. *International Journal of Social Research Methodology*, 11(5), 389-401.
2. Barker, M. (1981). *The new racism: conservatives and the ideology of the tribe*. Junction Books.
3. Berger, A. A. (2015). *Media and communication research methods: An introduction to qualitative and quantitative approaches*. Sage Publications.
4. Berry, M., Garcia-Blanco, I., & Moore, K. (2016). Press coverage of the refugee and migrant crisis in the EU: a content analysis of five European countries.
5. Benn D. W. (1996). The Russian media in post-Soviet conditions. *Europe-Asia Studies*, 48(3), 471-479.
6. Bleich, E., Bloemraad, I., & de Graauw, E. (2015). Migrants, minorities and the media: Information, representations and participation in the public sphere. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 41(6), 857-873.
7. Bleich, E., Bloemraad, I., & de Graauw, E. (2015). Migrants, minorities and the media: Information, representations and participation in the public sphere. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 41(6), 857-873.
8. Cameron, D., & Panovic, I. (2014). *Working with written discourse*. Sage.
9. Christoph, Vanessa. The Role of the Mass Media in the Integration of Migrants. *Mind, Brain, and Education* 6.2 (2012): 97-107.
10. De Smaele, H. (1999). The applicability of Western media models on the Russian media system. *European Journal of Communication*, 14(2), 173-189.
11. Dunn, J. A. (2014). Lottizzazione Russian style: Russia's two-tier media system. *Europe-Asia Studies*, 66(9), 1425-1451.
12. Fotopoulos, S., & Kaimaklioti, M. (2016). Media discourse on the refugee crisis: on what have the Greek, German and British press focused?. *European View*, 15(2), 265-279.
13. Fiske, J. (2010). *Introduction to communication studies*. Routledge.
14. Fairclough, N., Wodak, R. & Van Dijk, T. (Ed.). (2011). *Discourse studies: A multidisciplinary introduction*. Sage.

15. Fairclough, N., & Wodak, R. (1995). Critical discourse analysis.
16. Gabdulhakov, R. (2016). Russian media discourse on Syrian refugees in Europe and Central Asian labor migrants in Russia: Russia for Russians, Europe for...? Norwegian Institute of International Affairs
17. Hagstrom, M. (2000). Control over the media in the post Soviet Russia. Russian Reports. Studies in post-communist transformation of media and journalism. Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International.
18. Hansen, A., & Machin, D. (2013). Media and communication research methods. Palgrave Macmillan.
19. Wodak, R., & Meyer, M. (2009). Critical discourse analysis: History, agenda, theory and methodology. na.
20. Hansen, A., & Machin, D. (2013). Media and communication research methods. Palgrave Macmillan.
21. Joris, W., d'Haenens, L., Van Gorp, B., & Mertens, S. (2016). The Refugee Crisis in Europe: A Frame Analysis of European Newspapers.
22. Jensen, K. B. (Ed.). (2013). A handbook of media and communication research: Qualitative and quantitative methodologies. Routledge.
23. Lippman, W. (1922). Public opinion.
24. Malinkin, M. E., & Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars. (2015). A Long Road to Asylum: Syrian Refugees in Russia.
25. Monitoring, B. B. C. (2008). The press in Russia. BBC News, Europe, 16.
26. Price, M. E., Richter, A. G., & Peter, K. Y. (Eds.). (2002). Russian media law and policy in the Yeltsin decade: essays and documents. Kluwer Law International.
27. Parker, S. (2015). 'Unwanted invaders': The representation of refugees and asylum seekers in the UK and Australian print media. eSharp, 23.
28. Rantanen, T. (2002). The global and the national: media and communications in post-Communist Russia. Rowman & Littlefield.
29. Richter, A. G. (1995). The Russian press after perestroika. Canadian Journal of Communication, 20(1), 7.
30. Rosenholm, A., Nordenstreng, K., & Trubina, E. (Eds.). (2010). Russian mass media and changing values. Routledge.

31. Sheftelevich, Y. (2009). The states of the media law in the Russian Federation: A difficult past, an interesting present, an unclear future. *Touro International Law Review*, 12, 88-106.
32. Szczepanik, M. (2016). The 'Good' and 'Bad' Refugees? Imagined Refugeehood (s) in the Media Coverage of the Migration Crisis. *Journal of Identity and Migration Studies*, 10(2), 23.
33. Trappel, J. (2011). *Media in Europe today*. Intellect Books.
34. White, A. (2015). *Moving stories: International review of how media cover migration*.
35. Wetherell, M., & Potter, J. (1992). *Mapping the language of racism: Discourse and the legitimization of exploitation*. Columbia University Press.
36. Vartanova, E., Nieminen, H., & Salminen, M. M. (Eds.). (2009). *Perspectives to the Media in Russia: "Western" Interests and Russian Developments*. Helsinki: Aleksanteri Institute.
37. Vartanova, E.L. et al., (2016). The Russian Media Industry in Ten Years: Industrial Forecasts. *Westminster Papers in Communication and Culture*. 11(1), pp.65–84. / URL:<http://www.westminsterpapers.org/articles/10.16997/wpcc.221/>
38. Vartanova, E. (2012). The Russian media model in the context of post-Soviet dynamics. *Comparing media systems beyond the Western world*, 119-142.
39. Van Dijk, T. A. (1977). Context and cognition: Knowledge frames and speech act comprehension. *Journal of pragmatics*, 1(3), 211-231.
40. Van Dijk, T. A. (1987). *Communicating racism: Ethnic prejudice in thought and talk*. Sage Publications, Inc.
41. Van Dijk, T. A. (1985). Handbook of discourse analysis. In *Discourse and dialogue*.
42. Van Dijk, T. A. (Ed.). (1997). *Discourse as structure and process* (Vol. 1). Sage.
43. Van Dijk, T. A. (1997). *Discourse as social interaction* (Vol. 2). Sage.
44. Van Dijk, T. A. (2013). *News analysis: Case studies of international and national news in the press*. Routledge.
45. Van Dijk, T. A. (2000). New (s) racism: A discourse analytical approach. *Ethnic minorities and the media*, 37.

46. Van Dijk, T. A. (Ed.). (2011). Discourse studies: A multidisciplinary introduction. Sage.
47. Van Dijk, T. A. (1991). Media contents: The disciplinary study of news as discourse. Handbook of qualitative methodologies in mass communication research, 105-120.
48. Van Dijk, T. A. (2015). Racism and the Press (Vol. 5). Routledge.
49. Zasurskii, I. (2004). Media and power in post-Soviet Russia. ME Sharpe.
50. Zassoursky, Y. N. (2001). Media and the public interest: Balancing between the state, business and the public sphere. Russian media challenge, 155-188.
51. Zassoursky, Y. N. (1996). Freedom and responsibility in the Russian media. ECQUID NOVI, 17(2), 258-268.
52. Базина, Е. С. (2015). Тема миграции и мигрантов в российских СМИ: образ «чужого» и проблема информационной объективности. Москва: Высшая школа экономики, (23), 24-36.
53. Дзялошинский, И. М. (2001). Методы деятельности СМИ в условиях становления гражданского общества.
54. Засурский, И. (Ed.). (1999). Масс-медиа второй республики. Изд-во Московского университета.

Annex 1. List of articles

KOMMERSANT

"Окажите давление на Сирию, окажите давление на людей в Донбассе"

Верховный комиссар ООН по делам беженцев Филиппо Гранди об итогах визита в Москву

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/3228209>

Date of publication: 28.02.2017

Гуманитарные конвои перестали доходить до сирийцев

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/3066848>

Date of publication: 19.08.2016

Инцидентное право

Серия нападений, совершенных мигрантами, вынуждает Германию менять политику и законы

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/3047559>

Date of publication: 26.07.2016

Чеченские мигранты вписались в немецкую статистику

Выходцы из республики лидируют среди граждан РФ, ищущих убежище в ФРГ

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/3037977>

Date of publication: 15.07.2016

Между профессором и агрессором

Миграционный кризис поставил австрийцев перед четким выбором

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2993578>

Date of publication: 21.05.2016

Бежать в Россию надо в последнюю очередь

РФ оказалась в конце рейтинга лояльности к переселенцам

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2990917>

Date of publication: 20.05.2016

"Это не кризис большого числа беженцев, это кризис солидарности"

"Ъ" публикует статью генсека ООН Пан Ги Муна о положении мигрантов

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2990885>

Date of publication: 20.05.2016

Австрия стала страной замков

Накануне второго тура президентских выборов, сулящих победу ультраправому кандидату, Вена закрывает границы

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2975366>

Date of publication: 29.04.2016

Немецкие евроскептики поднялись на мигрантах

Регионы Германии оценят планы ЕС по борьбе с нелегалами

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2932736>

Date of publication: 09.03.2016

Турция и Украина приблизились к Шенгену

В обмен Анкара готова уже с воскресенья ограничивать приток нелегальных мигрантов в ЕС

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2942815>

Date of publication: 19.03.2016

"Возможности Германии принимать и интегрировать новых беженцев ограничены"

Депутат Бундестага рассказал "Ъ" о том, в каком случае ФРГ может усилить погранконтроль

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2927706>

Date of publication: 02.03.2016

Беженцам направляют квоту протеста

Венгрия, Австрия и балканские страны ищут способы сдержать поток переселенцев

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2923881>

Date of publication: 26.02.2016

Ангела Меркель приблизилась к истокам миграционного кризиса

Канцлер ФРГ из Анкары раскритиковала российскую операцию в Сирии

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2911513>

Date of publication: 09.02.2016

У себя не хотят и Европе не советуют

Россияне стали меньше сочувствовать беженцам с Ближнего Востока

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2911207>

Date of publication: 08.02.2016

"Мы считаем Россию в целом безопасной страной"

Посол Норвегии рассказал "Ъ" о спорах с российскими властями по поводу мигрантов

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2906699>

Date of publication: 03.02.2016

"Отношения с Россией для Красного Креста имеют стратегическое значение"

Глава московского офиса организации о планах на 2016 год, ситуации на Украине и в Сирии

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2900652>

Date of publication: 26.01.2016

Ангела Меркель и ее соратники разошлись на границе

В правящей коалиции критикуют миграционную политику канцлера ФРГ

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/2896328>

Date of publication: 20.01.2016

ЕГЭ выполняет интернациональный долг

Сирийские абитуриенты в Дамаске сдают экзамен в российские вузы

<https://kommersant.ru/doc/3043804>

Date of publication: 22.07.2016

VEDOMOSTI

«Мы не можем сдерживать людей, спасающихся бегством»

Антониу Гутерриш может сильно повлиять на ситуацию с беженцами в ЕС: от чиновников он будет добиваться гуманного отношения, от бизнеса – денег

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/characters/2016/10/10/660200-mi-ne-mozhem>

Date of publication: 10.10.2016

Международная жизнь

Меркель отказалась закрыть Германию для мигрантов

Зато канцлер предложила новые меры безопасности на уровне ЕС, в том числе общую информационную систему по мигрантам

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/articles/2016/07/28/650929-merkel-otkazalas-zakrit>

Date of publication: 28.07.2016

Устроивший взрыв в Баварии сириец оказался сторонником ИГ

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/07/25/650483-utroivshii-vzriv-bavarii-siriets-okazalsya-storonnikom-ig>

Date of publication: 25.07.2016

Сирийский беженец с мачете убил одного человека и ранил двух в ФРГ

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/07/24/650344-siriiskii-bezhenets>

Date of publication: 24.07.2016

Эрдоган заявил о возможном предоставлении гражданства Турции беженцам

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/07/03/647723-erdogan-zayavil>

Date of publication: 03.06.2016

Соглашение Брюсселя и Анкары по беженцам может быть сорвано

Из-за приостановления Евросоюзом работы по введению безвизового режима с Турцией

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/articles/2016/05/12/640716-soglashenie-bezhentsam>

Date of publication: 12.05.2016

ООН: Необходимо расследование авиаудара по лагерю беженцев в Сирии

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/05/06/640209-oon-neobhodimo>

Date of publication: 06.05.2016

Греция начала депортировать беженцев в Турцию

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/04/04/636278-gretsiya-nachala-deportirovat>

Date of publication: 04.04.2016

Amnesty International: Турция высылает в Сирию 100 беженцев ежедневно

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/04/01/636042-amnesty-international>

Date of publication: 01.04.2016

The Times: Турция расстреливает сирийских беженцев на границе

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/03/31/635853-turtsiya-rasstrelivaet-bezhentsev>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

СМИ рассказали о новых ограничениях для въезда в Македонию беженцев

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/03/06/632657-smi>

Date of publication: 06.03.2016

НАТО: Сирийские беженцы стали оружием России

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/03/02/632174-nato-bezhentsi-rossii>

Date of publication: 02.03.2016

Эрдоган грозит ЕС и ООН новой волной беженцев из Сирии

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/02/11/628605-erdogan>

Date of publication: 11.02.2016

Турция продолжит принимать сирийских беженцев

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/02/07/627692-turtsiya-prodolzhit>

Date of publication: 07.02.2016

Австрия хочет отправлять сирийских беженцев обратно в Турцию

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/02/06/627461-avstriya>

Date of publication: 06.02.2016

Германия выделит ООН 500 млн евро на помощь сирийским беженцам

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/02/03/626659-germaniya-500-mln-evro-bezhentsam>

Date of publication: 03.02.2016

Гуманитарный – значит первостепенный

Директор РСМД Андрей Кортунов о том, как организовать помощь мирному населению Сирии

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/opinion/articles/2016/02/03/626578-gumanitarnii-znachit-pervostepennii>

Date of publication: 03.02.2016

Турция потребовала выделить ей 5 млрд евро для удержания беженцев – СМИ

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/01/30/626120-turtsiya>

Date of publication: 30.01.2016

Глаза боятся – законы пишутся

Исследователь миграции Ольга Гулина о том, как Европа решает проблему наплыва беженцев

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/opinion/articles/2016/01/28/625808-glaza-boyatsya-zakoni-pishutsya>

Date of publication: 28 января 2016

Неизвестный в Канаде распылил перцовый газ в толпу беженцев из Сирии

<http://www.vedomosti.ru/politics/news/2016/01/09/623370-neizvestnii>

Date of publication: 09.01.2016

NOVAYA GAZETA

Сирийцы и пустота

Как семья беженцев из Ракки выживает в полуразрушенном таежном селе

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/12/09/70839-sirytsy-i-pustota>

Date of publication: 08.12.2016

Где, кого, за что

Громкие процессы недели

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/11/11/70492-gde-kogo-za-cto>

Date of publication: 10.11.2016

Билет в Алеппо

Россия не депортирует сирийских беженцев, она их просто не замечает

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/11/02/70392-bilet-v-aleppo>

Date of publication: 01.11.2016

Спасти Сирию

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/10/19/70223-spasti-siriyu>

Date of publication: 19.10.2016

«Забор уже построен. В головах»

Норвегия отгораживается от России стеной, высота — 4 метра

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/10/15/70187-zabor-uzhe-postroen-v-golovah>

Date of publication: 15.10.2016

Семь пунктов для спасения Европы

Джордж Сорос — о миграционном кризисе и судьбе европейской цивилизации

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/07/29/69401-sem-punktov-dlya-spaseniya-evropy>

Date of publication: 29.07.2016

Террор переходит границы

Выслать всех беженцев требуют немцы после «кровавой недели»

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/07/27/69378-terror-perehodit-granitsy>

Date of publication: 27.07.2016

Взрыв в Баварии устроил сирийский беженец

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/07/25/123505-vzryv-v-bavarii-ustroil-siriyskiy-bezhenets>

Date of publication: 25.07.2016

От политики «Добро пожаловать» до инцидента со свиными хвостами

Опыт Турции, Германии, Болгарии, Венгрии и Греции по борьбе с миграционным кризисом

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/07/14/69262-ot-politiki-dobro-pozhalovat-do-intsidenta-so-svinymi-hvostami>

Date of publication: 14.10.2016

28 человек погибли в результате авиаудара по лагерю беженцев в Сирии

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/05/05/121438-28-chelovek-pogibli-v-rezultate-aviaudara-po-lageryu-bezhentsev-v-sirii>

Date of publication: 05.05.2016

Россия предоставила убежище семье Ахмед из Сирии

Семья сирийских беженцев, прожившая больше двух месяцев в транзитной зоне аэропорта

Шереметьево, сегодня получила на руки российские документы

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/04/25/68376-rossiya-predostavila-ubezhische-semie-ahmed-iz-sirii>

Date of publication: 25.04.2016

Путь в греки

Почему визит Папы Римского в лагерь беженцев не дал надежды на разрешение кризиса

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/04/19/68275-put-v-greki>

Date of publication: 19.04.2016

Подвал для несовершеннолетних агентов

Центр адаптации и обучения детей-беженцев, лишенный помещения и признанный российскими властями «иностранным агентом», продолжает бороться за право выполнять функции, которыми пренебрегает государство

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/04/10/68159-podval-dlya-nesovershennoletnih-agentov>

Date of publication: 10.04.2016

Эрдоган пригрозил ЕС разрывом договора о беженцах

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/04/07/120487-erdogan-prigorozil-es-razryvom-dogovora-o-bezhentsah>

Date of publication: 07.04.2016

Греция депортировала в Турцию первых беженцев в рамках соглашения с ЕС

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/04/04/120349-gretsiya-deportirovala-v-turtsiyu-pervyh-bezhentsev-v-ramkah-soglasheniya-s-es>

Date of publication: 04.04.2016

Турция опровергла информацию о расстреле сирийских беженцев

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/31/120229-turtsiya-oproverгла-informatsiyu-o-rasstrele-siriyskih-bezhentsev>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

The Times сообщила о расстреле сирийских беженцев на границе с Турцией

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/31/120217-the-times-soobschila-o-rasstrele-siriyskih-bezhentsev-na-granitse-s-turtsiei>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

Широкая душа захлопнулась

Real politics победила европейские ценности: эмигрантов больше видеть не хотят. Итоги сделки Европа — Турция

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/03/29/67991-shirokaya-dusha-zahlopnulas>

Date of publication: 29.03.2016

Что в Дамаск, что в Москву

Норвегия отказалась от высылки беженцев в Россию. Почему это опасно

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/03/24/67921-что-v-damask-что-v-moskvu>

Date of publication: 24.03.2016

Берег турецкий стал ближе к Европе: итоги саммита о миграционном кризисе

В пятницу в Брюсселе произошли два события, вроде бы не связанные между собой. Но они, как фотовспышка, высветили срез проблем современного мира.

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/03/19/67851-bereg-turetskiy-stal-blizhe-k-evrope-itogi-sammita-o-migratsionnom-krizise>

Date of publication: 19.03.2016

ЕС и Турция приняли соглашение по ограничению миграции

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/18/119833-es-i-turtsiya-prinyali-soglashenie-po-ogranicheniyu-migratsii>

Date of publication: 18.03.2016

Турецкий транзит

Договоренности ЕС с Анкарой позволят закрыть канал нелегальной миграции через Эгейское море и Западные Балканы

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/03/08/67698-turetskiy-tranzit>

Date of publication: 08.03.2016

Евросоюз и Турция договорились о регулировании миграционного кризиса

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/08/119450-evrosoyuz-i-turtsiya-dogovorilis-o-regulirovanii-migratsionnogo-krizisa>

Date of publication: 08.03.2016

Глава Европарламента призвал беженцев запрашивать убежище в ЕС с территории Турции

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/07/119443-glava-evroparlamenta-prizval-bezhentsev-zaprashivat-ubezhische-v-es-s-territorii-turtsii>

Date of publication: 07.03.2016

В результате кораблекрушения у берегов Турции погибли 18 мигрантов

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/06/119418-v-rezultate-korablekrusheniya-u-beregov-turtsii-pogibli-18-migrantov>

Date of publication: 06.03.2016

В Турции вынесли приговор причастным к гибели сирийского мальчика

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/03/04/119370-v-turtsii-vynesli-prigovor-prichastnym-k-gibeli-siriyskogo-malchika>

Date of publication: 04.03.2016

Троих сирийских беженцев депортируют из России

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/02/25/119065-troih-siriyskih-bezhentsev-deportiruyut-iz-rossii>

Date of publication: 25.02.2016

Проблему беженцев просят решать без проволочек. Колючих

Европейские политики предлагают по-разному решить миграционный кризис: чем восточнее — тем жестче

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/02/18/67499-problemu-bezhentsev-prosyat-reshat-bez-provolochek-kolyuchih>

Date of publication: 18.02.2016

Глава Евросовета: Россия спровоцировала усиление миграции из Сирии

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/02/09/118468-glava-evrosoveta-rossiya-sprovotsirovala-usilenie-migratsii-iz-sirii>

Date of publication: 09.02.2016

Тысячи человек бежали из Алеппо из-за возможной осады города

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/02/06/118364-tysyachi-chelovek-bezhali-iz-aleppo-iz-za-vozmozhnoy-osady-goroda>

Date of publication: 06.02.2016

Патрушев призвал дать возможность беженцам голосовать на выборах

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/01/27/118050-patrushev-prizval-dat-vozmozhnost-bezhentsam-golosovat-na-vyborah>

Date of publication: 27.01.2016

Двери закрываются

Россия отказалась принимать выходцев с Ближнего Востока, депортируемых из Норвегии, хотя у большинства из них есть документы на право проживания в РФ

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/01/27/67205-dveri-zakryvayutsya>

Date of publication: 26.01.2016

Беженцы и хлам

Финляндия пытается сократить приток мигрантов с Ближнего Востока, но они с помощью предприимчивых россиян находят все новые способы пересечения границы

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/articles/2016/01/11/67015-bezhentsy-i-hlam>

Date of publication: 11.01.2016

В Канаде неизвестный распылил перцовый газ на группу беженцев

<https://www.novayagazeta.ru/news/2016/01/09/117537-v-kanade-neizvestnyy-raspylil-perechnyy-gaz-na-gruppu-bezhentsev>

Date of publication: 09.01.2016

ROSSIYSKAYA GAZETA

События в Сирии привели к росту числа беженцев в России

<https://rg.ru/2016/12/14/sobytiia-v-sirii-priveli-k-rostu-chisla-bezhencev-v-rossii.html>

Date of publication: 14.12.2016

Россия опровергла "невероятные потери" среди жителей Алеппо

<https://rg.ru/2016/11/29/rossiia-oprovergla-neveroiatnye-poteri-sredi-zhitelej-aleppo.html>

Date of publication: 29.11.2016

В Берлине по подозрению в терроризме задержали сирийца

<https://rg.ru/2016/11/03/v-berline-po-podozreniiu-v-terrorizme-zaderzhali-sirijca.html>

Date of publication: 03.11.2016

В Дании семью беженцев насмерть заморозили в холодильнике

<https://rg.ru/2016/11/01/v-danii-semiu-bezhencev-na-smert-zamorozili-doma-v-holodilnike.html>

Date of publication: 01.11.2016

Канада приняла 33 тысячи беженцев из Сирии с конца прошлого года

<https://rg.ru/2016/11/16/kanada-priniala-33-tysiachi-bezhencev-iz-sirii-s-konca-proshlogo-goda.html>

Date of publication: 16.11.2016

Недетские игры и игрушки

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/27/zhiteli-londona-vyshli-na-ulicy-s-trebovaniem-mira-dlia-detej-v-aleppo.html>

Date of publication: 27.10.2016

Турция пригрозила ЕС разрывом миграционного соглашения

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/19/turciia-prigrozila-es-razryvom-migracionnogo-soglasheniia.html>

Date of publication: 19.10.2016

Свыше 17 тысяч беженцев подали в суд на Германию

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/19/svyshe-17-tysiach-bezhencev-podali-v-sud-na-germaniiu.html>

Date of publication: 19.10.2016

Самой пожилой беженкой в мире стала 115-летняя жительница Сирии

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/15/samoj-pozhiloi-bezhenkoj-v-mire-stala-115-letniaia-zhitelnica-sirii.html>

Date of publication: 15.10.2016

Сирийский беженец планировал совершить теракт в Берлине на этой неделе

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/12/sirijskij-bezhence-planiroval-sovershit-terakt-v-berline-na-etoi-nedeli.html>

Date of publication: 12.10.2016

Количество беженцев в ФРГ сократилось в три раза

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/12/kolichestvo-bezhencev-v-frg-sokratilos-v-tri-raza.html>

Date of publication: 12.10.2016

Премьер Болгарии обвинил в европейском миграционном кризисе США и РФ

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/06/premer-bolgarii-obvinil-v-evropejskom-migracionnom-krizise-ssha-i-rf.html>

Date of publication: 06.10.2016

В Алеппо беженцам передали порядка 1,5 тонны продуктов

<https://rg.ru/2016/09/29/v-aleppo-bezhencam-peredali-poriadka-15-tonny-produktov.html>

Date of publication: 29.09.2016

На греческом острове Лесбос полностью выгорел лагерь для беженцев

<https://rg.ru/2016/09/20/na-grechskom-ostrove-lesbos-polnostiu-vygorel-lager-dlia-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 20.09.2016

Мигранты без ответственности

<https://rg.ru/2016/09/19/cipras-prizval-es-razdelit-s-greciej-otvetstvennost-za-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 19.09.2016

Руками не бить

<https://rg.ru/2016/09/08/vengerskuii-zhurnalistku-otdadut-pod-sud-za-pomoshch-policejskomu.html>

Date of publication: 08.09.2016

В Венгрии журналистке предъявили обвинения за подножку мигранту

<https://rg.ru/2016/09/07/v-vengrii-zhurnalistke-prediaivil-obvineniia-za-podnozhku-migrantu.html>

Date of publication: 07.09.2016

Восемь беженцев погибли в ДТП с участием автобуса на юге Турции

<https://rg.ru/2016/08/26/vosem-bezhencev-pogibli-v-dtp-s-uchastiem-avtobusa-na-iuge-turcii.html>

Date of publication: 26.08.2016

Российские военные доставили в Хаму две тонны гуманитарной помощи

<https://rg.ru/2016/07/28/rossijskie-voennye-dostavili-v-hamu-dve-tonny-gumanitarnoj-pomoshchi.html>

Date of publication: 28.07.2016

Милош Земан выступил против размещения беженцев-мусульман в Чехии

<https://rg.ru/2016/08/02/milosh-zeman-vystupil-protiv-razmeshcheniia-bezhencev-musulman-v-chehii.html>

Date of publication: 02.08.2016

Половина сирийских беженцев в Турции хотят вернуться в Сирию

<https://rg.ru/2016/07/19/polovina-sirijskih-bezhencev-v-turcii-hotiat-vernutsia-v-siriiu.html>

Date of publication: 19.07.2016

Эрдоган: Сирийские беженцы могут стать гражданами Турции

<https://rg.ru/2016/07/03/erdogan-sirijskie-bezhency-mogut-stat-grazhdanami-turcii.html>

Date of publication: 03.07.2016

Турецкие пограничники расстреляли сирийскую семью из 11 человек

<https://rg.ru/2016/06/19/tureckie-pogranichniki-rasstreliali-sirijskuu-semiu-iz-11-chelovek.html>

Date of publication: 19.06.2016

Около 80 процентов беженцев въехали в Германию без паспортов

<https://rg.ru/2016/06/08/okolo-80-procentov-bezhencev-vehali-v-germaniiu-bez-pasportov.html>

Date of publication: 08.06.2016

ОДКБ продолжит контролировать потоки беженцев из горячих точек

<https://rg.ru/2016/06/07/odkb-prodolzhit-kontrolirovat-potoki-bezhencev-iz-goriachih-toчек.html>

Date of publication: 07.06.2016

СМИ: Дети сирийских беженцев шьют форму ДАИШ на фабриках в Турции

<https://rg.ru/2016/06/07/smi-deti-sirijskih-bezhencev-shiut-formu-daish-na-fabrikah-v-turcii.html>

Date of publication: 07.06.2016

Беженцы устроили побоище в "джунглях" Кале: 20 раненых

<https://rg.ru/2016/05/26/bezhency-ustroili-poboishche-v-dzhungliah-kale-20-ranenyh.html>

Date of publication: 26.05.2016

В Софии три человека пострадали в ходе массовой драки мигрантов

<https://rg.ru/2016/05/25/v-sofii-tri-cheloveka-postradali-v-hode-massovoj-draki-migrantov.html>

Date of publication: 25.05.2016

Премьер Болгарии обвинил в европейском миграционном кризисе США и РФ

<https://rg.ru/2016/10/06/premer-bolgarii-obvinil-v-evropejskom-migracionnom-krizise-ssha-i-rf.html>

Date of publication: 06.10.2016

Греческий суд позволил беженцам не возвращаться в Турцию

<https://rg.ru/2016/05/21/grecheskij-sud-pozvolil-bezhencam-ne-vozvrashchatsia-v-turciiu.html>

Date of publication: 21.05.2016

Япония в течение пяти лет примет на обучение 150 сирийских студентов

<https://rg.ru/2016/05/20/iaponiia-v-techenie-piati-let-primet-na-obuchenie-150-sirijskih-studentov.html>

Date of publication: 20.05.2016

На войне и то лучше

<https://rg.ru/2016/05/17/turciiu-ulichili-v-nedobrosovestnom-obrashchenii-s-bezhencami.html>

Date of publication: 17.05.2016

Трамп: Беженцы могут повторить теракты 11 сентября

<https://rg.ru/2016/05/16/tramp-bezhency-mogut-povtorit-terakty-11-sentiabria.html>

Date of publication: 16.05.2016

Песков прокомментировал авиаудар по лагерю беженцев в Идлибе

<https://rg.ru/2016/05/06/peskov-prokomentiroval-aviaudar-po-lageriu-bezhencev-v-idlibe.html>

Date of publication: 06.05.2016

РФ доставила гуманитарную помощь в центр по приему беженцев в Латакии

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/26/rf-dostavila-gumanitarnuiu-pomoshch-v-centr-po-priemu-bezhencev-v-latakii.html>

Date of publication: 26.04.2016

Мигранты напоказ

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/24/v-turcii-kancleru-frg-pokazali-reklamnyj-lager-dlia-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 24.04.2016

Туск назвал Турцию лучшим примером обращения с беженцами

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/24/tusk-nazval-turciiu-luchshim-primerom-obrashcheniia-s-bezhencami.html>

Date of publication: 24.04.2016

Россия доставила в Сирию 6 тонн продуктов

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/23/rossiia-peredala-zhiteliam-provincii-hama-6-tonn-gumanitarnyh-gruzov.html>

Date of publication: 23.04.2016

Приток беженцев в Грецию сократился

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/20/pritok-bezhencev-v-greciiu-sokratilsia.html>

Date of publication: 20.04.2016

Турецкие пограничники снова обстреляли сирийских беженцев

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/20/tureckie-pogranichniki-snova-obstreliali-sirijskih-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 20.04.2016

Европа выучит турецкий

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/19/ankara-reshila-probit-dorogu-v-es-s-pomoshchiu-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 19.04.2016

Беженцы в сирийской Латакии получили гуманитарную помощь из РФ

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/18/bezhency-v-sirijskoj-latakii-poluchili-gumanitarnuiu-pomoshch-iz-rf.html>

Date of publication: 18.04.2016

Иордания попросит от ЕС дополнительного финансирования на беженцев

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/14/iordaniia-poprosit-ot-es-dopolnitelnogo-finansirovaniia-na-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 14.04.2016

В сирийском лагере беженцев боевики ДАИШ напали на "Фронт ан-Нусра"

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/12/v-sirijskom-lagere-bezhencev-boeviki-daish-napali-na-front-an-nusra.html>

Date of publication: 12.04.2016

Три тонны муки из России доставлены в сирийский город Хама

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/06/tri-tonny-muki-iz-rossii-dostavleny-v-sirijskij-gorod-hama.html>

Date of publication: 06.04.2016

В Турции ребенка из Сирии "ради шутки" напугали бомбардировкой

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/05/v-turcii-rebenka-iz-sirii-radi-shutki-napugali-bombardirovkoj.html>

Date of publication: 05.04.2016

МИД РФ призвал Эрдогана прекратить нарушения прав человека

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/05/mid-rf-prizval-erdogana-prekratit-narusheniia-prav-cheloveka.html>

Date of publication: 05.04.2016

Беженцы в Греции стали массово сопротивляться возвращению в Турцию

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/04/bezhency-v-grecii-stali-massovo-soprotivliatsia-vozvrashcheniiu-v-turciiu.html>

Date of publication: 04.04.2016

Первая партия беженцев отправлена из Греции обратно в Турцию

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/04/pervaia-partiia-bezhencev-otpravlena-iz-grecii-obratno-v-turciiu.html>

Date of publication: 04.04.2016

Долгов: Турция нарушает права человека, высылая сирийских беженцев

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/02/dolgov-turciia-narushaet-prava-cheloveka-vysylaia-sirijskih-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 02.04.2016

Не менее 27 беженцев спасено у берегов Кипра

<https://rg.ru/2016/04/01/ne-menee-27-bezhencev-spaseno-u-beregov-kipra.html>

Date of publication: 01.04.2016

Клинцевич: Данные о расстреле беженцев в Турции подтверждаются

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/31/klinceovich-dannye-o-rasstrele-bezhencev-v-turcii-podtverzhdaetsia.html>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

В греческом порту Пирей произошла массовая драка между беженцами

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/31/v-grechskom-portu-pirej-proizoshla-massovaia-draka-mezhdu-bezhencami.html>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

В греческом порту Пирей произошла массовая драка между беженцами

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/31/v-grechskom-portu-pirej-proizoshla-massovaia-draka-mezhdu-bezhencami.html>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

СМИ: Турция стреляла на поражение в беженцев на границе с Сирией

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/31/smi-turciia-streliala-na-porazhenie-v-bezhencev-na-granice-s-siriej.html>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

Беженцам в Европе выделяют дополнительные места для расселения

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/31/bezhencam-v-evrope-vydeliat-dopolnitelnye-mesta-dlia-rasseleniia.html>

Date of publication: 31.03.2016

Бартер на беженцах

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/21/bezhency-stali-razmennoj-monetoj-v-geopoliticheskoi-igre-ankary-s-es.html>

Date of publication: 21.03.2016

ЕС назначил координатора по миграционному соглашению с Турцией

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/20/es-naznachil-koordinatora-po-migracionnomu-soglasheniiu-s-turciej.html>

Date of publication: 20.03.2016

Успеть к завтраку

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/17/es-i-turciia-zakliuchat-sdelku-po-bezhencam.html>

Date of publication: 17.03.2016

Анджелина Джоли встретила с беженцами в Афинах

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/17/andzhelina-dzholi-vstretilas-s-bezhencami-v-afinah.html>

Date of publication: 17.03.2016

РФ окажет помощь в доставке гуманитарных грузов в Сирию

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/07/v-minoborony-rf-zaiavili-o-sobliudenii-v-celom-peremiriia-v-sirii.html>

Date of publication: 07.03.2016

Анкара торгует кризисом

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/03/erdogan-nachal-otkryto-shantazirovat-evropu-sirijskimi-bezhencami.html>

Date of publication: 03.03.2016

Канадцы пожертвовали на доставку десяти тысяч сирийских беженцев

<https://rg.ru/2016/03/01/kanadcy-pozhertvovali-na-dostavku-desiati-tysiach-sirijskih-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 01.03.2016

Число сирийских беженцев в мире превысило четыре млн человек

<https://rg.ru/2016/02/26/mid-rf-chislo-sirijskih-bezhencev-v-mire-sostavliaet-46-mln-chelovek.html>

Date of publication: 26.02.2016

Правозащитники назвали провалом политику Европы в отношении беженцев

<https://rg.ru/2016/02/24/pravozashchitniki-nazyvali-provalom-politiku-evropy-v-otnoshenii-bezhencev.html>

Date of publication: 24.02.2016

В США суд не удовлетворил просьбу запретить въезд беженцам из Сирии

<https://rg.ru/2016/02/09/v-ssha-sud-ne-udovletvoril-prosbu-zapretit-vezd-bezhencam-iz-sirii.html>

Date of publication: 09.02.2016

Число жертв крушения лодки с беженцами у берегов Турции выросло до 27

<https://rg.ru/2016/02/08/chislo-zherty-krusheniia-lodki-s-bezhencami-u-beregov-turcii-vyroslo-do-27.html>

Date of publication: 08.02.2016

Две лодки с беженцами затонули у берегов Турции: погибли 22 человека

<https://rg.ru/2016/02/08/dve-lodki-s-bezhencami-zatonuli-u-beregov-turcii-pogibli-33-cheloveka.html>

Date of publication: 08.02.2016

Медведев назвал причину миграционного кризиса в Европе

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/29/migracia-site-anons.html>

Date of publication: 29.01.2016

СМИ Австрии: Благодаря РФ сирийские беженцы начали возвращаться домой

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/17/bezentsy-site-anons.html>

Date of publication: 17.01.2016

Кто и зачем направляет потоки беженцев в Европу

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/17/avstria-site.html>

Date of publication: 17.01.2016

Во Франции сирийский беженец выиграл в лотерее миллион евро

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/16/loterea-anons.html>

Date of publication: 16.01.2016

Руки прочь от Германии!

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/14/germaniya.html>

Date of publication: 13.01.2016

Ошиблись в выборе

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/13/poland.html>

Date of publication: 13.01.2016

В Канаде неизвестный распылил перечный газ в толпу беженцев из Сирии

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/09/gazknada-site-anons.html>

Date of publication: 09.01.2016

Немецкие СМИ раскритиковали руководство ФРГ после событий в Кельне

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/08/kritika-site.html>

Date of publication: 08.01.2016

Полиция Кельна: Большинство преступников были сирийцами

<https://rg.ru/2016/01/07/politsia-site-anons.html>

Date of publication: 07.01.2016

Non-exclusive licence to reproduce thesis and make thesis public

I, Ekaterina Tikhonova
(author's name)
(personal identification code 48807200075),

1. herewith grant the University of Tartu a free permit (non-exclusive licence) to:

1.1. reproduce, for the purpose of preservation and making available to the public, including for addition to the DSpace digital archives until expiry of the term of validity of the copyright, and

1.2. make available to the public via the web environment of the University of Tartu, including via the DSpace digital archives until expiry of the term of validity of the copyright,


Representations of the Refugee Crisis in the Russian Media,
(title of thesis)

Supervised by Stefano Braghioli, PhD,
(supervisor's name)

2. I am aware of the fact that the author retains these rights.

3. I certify that granting the non-exclusive licence does not infringe the intellectual property rights or rights arising from the Personal Data Protection Act.

Tartu, 22.05.2017 (date)



Ekaterina Tikhonova (signature)